

Table of Contents

List of Figures	xvii
List of Tables	xxvi
List of Acronyms	xxxii
1 Introduction	2
2 Method and Related Work	6
2.1 Challenge Problem	6
2.1.1 Current State of the Art	7
2.1.1.1 Empirical Studies	7
2.1.1.2 Simulation Studies	8
2.1.1.3 Analytical Studies	8
2.1.2 Proposed Advance in the State of the Art	9
2.2 Potential Approaches	9
2.2.1 Expanded Empirical Studies	10
2.2.2 Expanded Simulation Studies	10
2.2.3 Expanded Analytical Studies	12
2.3 Selected Approach	12
2.4 Hard Problems	13
2.4.1 Model Scale	13
2.4.2 Model Validation	14
2.4.3 Tractable Analysis	14
2.4.4 Causal Analysis	14
2.4.5 Experiment Selection	14
2.5 Selected Solutions and Possible Alternatives	15
2.5.1 Scale Reduction	16
2.5.2 Sensitivity Analysis and Key Empirical Comparisons	19
2.5.3 Statistical Analysis Methods	21
2.5.4 Data-Supported Domain Expertise	24
2.5.5 Domain Expertise and Incremental Design	26
2.6 Conclusions	27
3 Description of MesoNet	30
3.1 Model Structure	30
3.1.1 Model Elements	31
3.1.1.1 Sources	31
3.1.1.2 Receivers	33
3.1.1.3 Access Routers	33
3.1.1.4 Point-of-Presence Routers	35
3.1.1.5 Backbone Routers	35
3.1.1.6 Backbone Links	36
3.1.2 Network Topology	36
3.1.2.1 Four-Tier Structure	38
3.1.2.2 Heterogeneous Composition	39
3.1.2.3 Flow Classes	39
3.1.2.4 Fixed-Path Routing	39
3.1.2.5 Simulated Abilene Characteristics	40
3.1.3 Simulated Packets	41
3.1.4 Relating Abstract Time to Real Time	42
3.2 Model Configuration	43

3.2.1	Simulation Control Parameters _____	43
3.2.2	Parameters Defining User Behavior _____	44
3.2.3	Parameters Adapting Network Topology _____	44
3.2.4	Parameters Describing Sources and Receivers _____	45
3.2.5	Parameters Specifying Special Long-Lived Flows _____	47
3.2.6	Parameters for Transport Protocols _____	49
3.2.7	Parameters Identifying Monitored Links _____	50
3.2.8	Reporting Parameter Settings _____	50
3.3	Model Measurements _____	50
3.3.1	General Measurement Regime _____	51
3.3.2	Summary Measures _____	51
3.3.3	Aggregate Measures _____	52
3.3.4	Flow-Class Measures _____	55
3.3.5	Long-Lived Flow Measures _____	57
3.3.6	Per-Router Measures _____	58
3.3.6.1	Measurements Common to All Routers _____	59
3.3.6.2	Measurements Unique to Access Routers _____	60
3.3.7	Optional, Link-Level Measures _____	61
3.3.8	Augmenting Measures _____	61
3.4	Tracing Flow Behavior _____	63
3.4.1	Tracing Flow States _____	63
3.4.2	Tracing Packets _____	64
3.5	Notes on Model Construction with SLX _____	64
3.5.1	Configuration File _____	65
3.5.2	Topology File _____	65
3.5.3	Model Behavior File _____	66
3.5.3.1	Model Elements _____	66
3.5.3.2	Simulation Control _____	66
3.5.3.3	Measurement Buffers _____	67
3.5.4	Performance Properties of MesoNet _____	67
3.5.4.1	Processing Requirements _____	69
3.5.4.2	Memory Requirements _____	69
4	Sensitivity Analysis of MesoNet _____	71
4.1	Method _____	73
4.1.1	Experiment Design _____	73
4.1.1.1	Identify Factors _____	73
4.1.1.2	Select Number of Levels and Level Settings for Factors _____	74
4.1.1.3	Select Specific Combinations to Simulate _____	74
4.1.1.4	Select Responses to Examine _____	76
4.1.2	Candidate Responses _____	77
4.1.2.1	Responses Characterizing Macroscopic Network Behavior _____	77
4.1.2.2	Responses Characterizing User Experience _____	78
4.1.3	Correlation Analysis and Clustering _____	79
4.1.3.1	Y-Y Scatter Plots _____	79
4.1.3.2	Correlation Computations _____	80
4.1.3.3	Combined Matrix Visualization _____	81
4.1.3.4	Index-Index Plot _____	82
4.1.4	Principal Components Analysis _____	83
4.1.5	10-Step Graphical Analysis of Selected Responses _____	84
4.1.6	Other Exploratory Plots and Analyses _____	87
4.2	Experiment Design for MesoNet Sensitivity Analysis _____	89
4.2.1	MesoNet Factors _____	89
4.2.1.1	Simulation Control Parameters _____	89
4.2.1.2	Parameters Controlling User Behavior _____	90
4.2.1.3	Parameters Adapting Network Characteristics _____	90

4.2.1.4	Parameters Altering Properties of Sources and Receivers	91
4.2.1.5	Parameters Controlling Source Startup Pattern	92
4.2.1.6	Parameters Related to TCP Operation	93
4.2.1.7	Summary of Factors Selected for Sensitivity Analysis	93
4.2.2	Number of Levels and Settings for MesoNet Factors	94
4.2.2.1	Two-Level Factor Settings	94
4.2.2.2	Rationale for (and Ramifications of) Network Factor Settings	94
4.2.2.3	Rationale for (and Ramifications of) User Factor Settings	96
4.2.2.4	Rationale for (and Ramifications of) Source & Receiver Factor Settings	97
4.2.2.5	Rationale for (and Ramifications of) Protocol Factor Settings	99
4.2.3	Specific Combinations Simulated	99
4.3	Experiment Execution	100
4.3.1	Resource Requirements for Simulations	100
4.3.2	Data Collection and Summarization	102
4.4	Correlation Analysis and Clustering	104
4.5	Principal Components Analysis	108
4.6	Sensitivity Analysis	111
4.6.1	Sensitivity Analysis Guided by Correlation Analysis	111
4.6.1.1	Congestion-Related Responses	112
4.6.1.2	Delay-Related Responses	115
4.6.1.3	Responses Related to Macroscopic Throughput	115
4.6.1.4	Responses Related to Advantaged Flow Classes	118
4.6.2	Sensitivity Analysis Guided by Principal Components Analysis	120
4.6.2.1	Congestion	120
4.6.2.2	Delay	121
4.6.2.3	Throughput for Advantaged Flows	123
4.6.2.4	Macroscopic Throughput	124
4.6.3	Summary of Findings from the Sensitivity Analysis	125
4.6.3.1	Main Aspects of Model Behavior	125
4.6.3.2	Major Factors Influencing Model Behavior	127
4.6.3.3	Factors Exhibiting Little Influence on Model Behavior	129
4.7	Exploring Effects of Buffer Sizing	129
4.7.1	Effects on Delay Variation	130
4.7.2	Effects on Other Aspects of Network Behavior	131
4.8	Conclusions	134
5	Modeling Alternate Congestion Control Mechanisms	137
5.1	TCP Congestion Control	138
5.1.1	Connection Phase	139
5.1.2	Transfer Phase – Slow Start	142
5.1.2.1	Standard Slow Start	142
5.1.2.2	Limited Slow Start	143
5.1.2.3	Setting Slow-Start Threshold	143
5.1.3	Transfer Phase – Congestion Avoidance	143
5.1.3.1	Increase Congestion Window after Acknowledgment	144
5.1.3.2	Decrease Congestion Window after Signaled Loss	144
5.1.3.3	Decrease Slow-Start Threshold and Reset Congestion Window after Timeout	144
5.1.3.4	Combined Effects of Slow Start and Congestion Avoidance	145
5.2	Congestion Avoidance Procedures for Six Alternate Congestion Control Mechanisms	146
5.2.1	BIC	147
5.2.1.1	Increase Procedures	148

5.2.1.2	Decrease Procedures	149
5.2.1.3	Timeout Procedures	149
5.2.2	CTCP	150
5.2.2.1	Increase Procedures	151
5.2.2.2	Decrease Procedures	151
5.2.2.3	Timeout Procedures	151
5.2.2.4	Periodic Procedures	151
5.2.3	FAST	152
5.2.3.1	Increase Procedures	152
5.2.3.2	Decrease Procedures	152
5.2.3.3	Timeout Procedures	154
5.2.3.4	Periodic Procedures	154
5.2.4	HSTCP	154
5.2.4.1	Increase Procedures	155
5.2.4.2	Decrease Procedures	155
5.2.4.3	Timeout Procedures	155
5.2.5	H-TCP	156
5.2.5.1	Increase Procedures	157
5.2.5.2	Decrease Procedures	157
5.2.5.3	Timeout Procedures	157
5.2.5.4	Periodic Procedures	158
5.2.6	Scalable TCP	158
5.2.6.1	Increase Procedures	158
5.2.6.2	Decrease Procedures	159
5.2.6.3	Timeout Procedures	159
5.3	Modeling the Transfer Phase in MesoNet	159
5.3.1	General Data Transfer Procedures	159
5.3.2	Slow Start	161
5.3.3	Congestion Avoidance	161
5.3.3.1	Acknowledgment Procedures	161
5.3.3.2	Negative Acknowledgment Procedures	161
5.3.3.3	Periodic Procedures	161
5.3.3.4	Timeout Procedures	161
5.4	Verifying Simulated Congestion Control Mechanisms	162
5.4.1	Standard TCP Congestion Control Model	163
5.4.2	Behavior of BIC Congestion Control Model	165
5.4.3	Behavior of CTCP Congestion Control Model	166
5.4.4	Behavior of FAST Congestion Control Model	167
5.4.5	Behavior of HSTCP Congestion Control Model	173
5.4.6	Behavior of H-TCP Congestion Control Model	173
5.4.7	Behavior of Scalable TCP Congestion Control Model	173
5.4.8	Summary of Behavior of MesoNet Congestion Control Models	178
6	Comparing Congestion Control Regimes in a Large, Fast Network	183
6.1	Experiment Design	183
6.1.1	Simulation Parameters	185
6.1.2	Conditions Simulated	189
6.1.3	Responses Measured	190
6.1.3.1	Measures of Macroscopic Behavior	190
6.1.3.2	Measures of User Experience	192
6.1.3.3	Measures of Buffer Usage	193
6.1.3.4	Aggregate Measures	194
6.2	Experiment Execution and Data Collection	195
6.2.1	Experiment Execution	195
6.2.2	Data Collection	198
6.3	Data Analysis Approach	199

6.3.1	Cluster Analysis	199
6.3.2	Detailed Analysis of Individual Responses	204
6.3.3	Condition-Response Summary Analysis	206
6.3.4	Data Exploration	208
6.3.4.1	Extrapolating from Time Series	208
6.3.4.2	Seeking Patterns	212
6.3.4.3	Investigating Data Subsets	213
6.3.4.4	Interactive Animation	213
6.4	Results	215
6.4.1	Time Period One (TP1)	215
6.4.1.1	Cluster Analysis for TP1	215
6.4.1.2	Condition-Response Summary for TP1	215
6.4.1.3	Analysis of Significant Responses for TP1	217
6.4.1.4	Summary of Results for TP1	220
6.4.2	Time Period Two (TP2)	220
6.4.2.1	Cluster Analysis for TP2	220
6.4.2.2	Condition-Response Summary for TP2	221
6.4.2.3	Analysis of Significant Responses for TP2	223
6.4.2.4	Summary of Results for TP2	223
6.4.3	Time Period Three (TP3)	228
6.4.3.1	Cluster Analysis for TP3	228
6.4.3.2	Condition-Response Summary for TP3	228
6.4.3.3	Analysis of Significant Responses for TP3	228
6.4.3.4	Summary of Results for TP3	234
6.4.4	Aggregated Responses (Totals)	234
6.4.4.1	Cluster Analysis for Totals	234
6.4.4.2	Condition-Response Summary for Totals	235
6.4.4.3	Analysis of Significant Responses for Totals	235
6.4.4.4	Summary of Results for Totals	238
6.5	Findings	238
6.5.1	Finding #1	238
6.5.2	Finding #2	241
6.5.3	Finding #3	246
6.5.4	Finding #4	248
6.5.5	Tendencies	250
6.6	Conclusions	250
7	Comparing Congestion Control Regimes in a Scaled-Down Network	253
7.1	Experiment Design	254
7.1.1	Changes in Robustness Factors and Fixed Factors	254
7.1.2	Orthogonal Fractional Factorial Design of Robustness Conditions	255
7.1.3	Domain View of Robustness Conditions	256
7.2	Experiment Execution and Data Collection	260
7.3	Data Analysis Approach	260
7.4	Results	263
7.4.1	Time Period One (TP1)	263
7.4.1.1	Cluster Analysis for TP1	264
7.4.1.2	Condition-Response Summary for TP1	264
7.4.1.3	Analysis of Significant Responses for TP1	264
7.4.1.4	Summary of Results for TP1	271
7.4.2	Time Period Two (TP2)	272
7.4.2.1	Cluster Analysis for TP2	272
7.4.2.2	Condition-Response Summary for TP2	272
7.4.2.3	Analysis of Significant Responses for TP2	272
7.4.2.4	Summary of Results for TP2	272
7.4.3	Time Period Three (TP3)	279

7.4.3.1	Cluster Analysis for TP3	279
7.4.3.2	Condition-Response Summary for TP3	279
7.4.3.3	Analysis of Significant Responses for TP3	279
7.4.3.4	Summary of Results for TP3	279
7.4.4	Aggregated Responses (Totals)	279
7.4.4.1	Cluster Analysis for Totals	285
7.4.4.2	Condition-Response Summary for Totals	285
7.4.4.3	Analysis of Significant Responses for Totals	287
7.4.4.4	Summary of Results for Totals	287
7.5	Findings	290
7.5.1	Finding #1	290
7.5.2	Finding #2	292
7.5.3	Finding #3	293
7.5.4	Finding #4	311
7.5.5	Tendencies	312
7.6	Conclusions	313
8	Comparing Congestion Control Regimes in a Heterogeneous Network	316
8.1	Experiment Design	317
8.1.1	Robustness Factors and Fixed Factors	317
8.1.1.1	Constraints on Flows of Large Size	320
8.1.1.2	Fixed Experiment Factors	322
8.1.2	Orthogonal Fractional Factorial Design of Robustness Conditions	324
8.1.3	Domain View of Robustness Conditions	325
8.1.4	Responses Measured	330
8.2	Experiment Execution and Data Collection	331
8.2.1	Computing Macroscopic Responses	333
8.2.2	Computing User Experience Responses	335
8.3	Data Analysis Approach	336
8.3.1	Analyzing Macroscopic Behavior	336
8.3.2	Analyzing User Experience	337
8.4	Results	342
8.4.1	Macroscopic Network Behavior	342
8.4.1.1	High Initial Slow-start Threshold	342
8.4.1.2	Low Initial Slow-start Threshold	347
8.4.2	Absolute User Experience	353
8.4.2.1	High Initial Slow-start Threshold	353
8.4.2.2	Low Initial Slow-start Threshold	361
8.4.2.3	Summary of Differences in Goodput	370
8.4.3	Relative User Experience	371
8.4.3.1	High Initial Slow-start Threshold	372
8.4.3.2	Low Initial Slow-start Threshold	380
8.4.3.3	Summary of Differences in Relative Goodput	388
8.5	Findings	389
8.5.1	Finding #1	390
8.5.2	Finding #2	390
8.5.3	Finding #3	391
8.5.4	Finding #4	391
8.6	Conclusions	391
9	Comparing Congestion Control Regimes in a Large, Fast, Heterogeneous Network	395
9.1	Changes in Experiment Design	396
9.1.1	Changes in Robustness Factors and Fixed Factors	396
9.1.2	Changes in Orthogonal Fractional Factorial Design of Robustness Conditions	397
9.1.3	Changes in Domain View of Robustness Conditions	397

9.1.4	Responses Measured _____	400
9.2	Experiment Execution and Data Collection _____	400
9.3	Data Analysis Approach _____	400
9.4	Results _____	401
9.4.1	Macroscopic Network Behavior _____	401
9.4.2	Absolute User Experience _____	407
9.4.3	Relative User Experience _____	417
9.5	Findings _____	427
9.5.1	Finding #1 _____	427
9.5.2	Finding #2 _____	427
9.5.3	Finding #3 _____	427
9.5.4	Finding #4 _____	428
9.6	Conclusions _____	428
10	Conclusions _____	431
10.1	Conclusions about Congestion Control Algorithms _____	431
10.1.1	Utility and Safety of Alternate Congestion Control Algorithms _____	431
10.1.1.1	Increase Rate _____	431
10.1.1.2	Loss/Recovery Processing _____	432
10.1.1.3	TCP Fairness _____	433
10.1.1.4	Utility Bounds _____	434
10.1.1.5	Safety _____	435
10.1.2	Characteristics of Individual Congestion Control Algorithms _____	436
10.1.2.1	BIC _____	437
10.1.2.2	CTCP _____	437
10.1.2.3	FAST _____	437
10.1.2.4	FAST-AT _____	438
10.1.2.5	HSTCP _____	438
10.1.2.6	HTCP _____	439
10.1.2.7	Scalable TCP _____	439
10.1.3	Recommendations _____	439
10.1.4	Future Work _____	440
10.2	Conclusions about Methods _____	440
10.2.1	Discrete Event Simulation _____	441
10.2.2	Scale Reduction Techniques _____	441
10.2.2.1	Model Restriction and Parameter Clustering _____	441
10.2.2.2	Two-Level Experiment Designs _____	442
10.2.2.3	Orthogonal Fractional Factorial Experiment (OFF) Designs _____	442
10.2.2.4	Correlation Analysis and Clustering _____	443
10.2.2.5	Principal Components Analysis (PCA) _____	443
10.2.3	Model Validation Techniques _____	443
10.2.3.1	Sensitivity Analysis _____	444
10.2.3.2	Key Empirical Comparisons _____	444
10.2.4	Data Analysis Methods _____	445
10.2.4.1	Ten-Step Graphical Analysis _____	445
10.2.4.2	Cluster Analysis _____	445
10.2.4.3	Custom Multidimensional Visualizations _____	446
10.2.4.4	Exploratory Multidimensional Interactive Visualization _____	446
10.2.5	Causality Analysis Methods _____	447
10.2.5.1	Principal Components Analysis (PCA) _____	447
10.2.5.2	Detailed Measurements _____	447
10.2.5.3	Scientific Method _____	448
10.2.5.4	Exploratory Analysis _____	448
10.2.6	Experiment Selection Methods _____	449
10.2.6.1	Factor Analysis _____	449

10.2.6.2	Domain Expertise _____	449
10.2.6.3	Incremental Design _____	449
10.2.7	Recommendations _____	450
10.2.8	Future Work _____	450
11	Bibliography _____	453
11.1	Fundamentals of Internet Design _____	453
11.2	Standard Transmission Control Protocol (TCP) _____	453
11.3	Internet Topology _____	454
11.4	Internet Traffic Characteristics _____	455
11.5	Internet Technology _____	455
11.6	Research on Data Transport in High Speed, High Delay Networks _____	456
11.7	Proposed Replacement Congestion Control Mechanisms for the Internet _____	456
11.8	Evaluating Internet Congestion Control Mechanisms _____	457
11.9	Internet Simulation and Models _____	458
11.10	Supporting Software Tools _____	458
11.11	Supporting Statistical Techniques _____	459
11.12	Empirical Internet Test Beds _____	459
11.13	General Related References _____	460
11.14	Analytical Internet Models _____	460
Appendix A	Understanding, Improving and Applying Fluid-Flow Models _____	463
A.1	Fluid-flow Approximation Models _____	463
A.1.1	Modeling Many Flows on One Link _____	465
A.1.2	Utility of Fluid-flow Approximation Models _____	467
A.1.3	Limitations of Fluid-flow Approximation Models _____	468
A.2	Applying Fluid-flow Approximation Models to Compare Alternate Congestion Control Algorithms _____	469
A.2.1	Computing Response Functions _____	471
A.2.1.1	TCP Reno _____	471
A.2.1.2	Cubic TCP _____	472
A.2.1.3	Compound TCP _____	475
A.2.2	Comparing Congestion Control Algorithms _____	477
A.3	Future Work _____	481
Appendix B	Computation Requirements: MesoNet vs. Hybrid Model _____	483
B.1	Experiment Design _____	483
B.2	Experiment Execution and Data Collection _____	488
B.3	Results _____	489
B.4	Discussion _____	489
B.5	Conclusions _____	490
Appendix C	Supplementary Sensitivity Analysis Results _____	493
C.1	Experiment Design _____	493
C.2	Experiment Execution and Data Collection _____	498
C.3	Results _____	500
C.3.1	Correlation Analysis _____	500
C.3.2	Principal Components Analysis _____	502
C.3.3	Exploratory Analysis of y7-y22 Scatter Plot Bifurcation _____	505
C.3.4	Main Effects Analysis _____	505
C.3.4.1	Congestion-Related Responses _____	507
C.3.4.2	Delay-Related Responses _____	510
C.3.4.3	Responses Related to Macroscopic Throughput _____	511
C.3.4.4	Responses Related to Advantaged Flow Classes _____	512
C.3.5	Summary of Findings from Sensitivity Analysis _____	515
C.3.6	Exploring Effects of Buffer Sizing _____	516

C.4	Discussion _____	519
C.5	Conclusions _____	521
Appendix D	10-Step Graphical Analysis Technique _____	523
D.1	Ordered Data Plot _____	524
D.2	Multi-factor Scatter Plot _____	525
D.3	Main Effects Plot _____	526
D.4	Interaction Effects Matrix _____	527
D.5	Block Plots _____	529
D.6	Youden Plot _____	530
D.7	 Effects Plot _____	531
D.8	Half-Normal Probability of Effects _____	532
D.9	Cumulative Residual Standard Deviation Plot _____	533
D.10	Contour Plot of Two Dominant Factors _____	533