NIST PRIVACY WORKFORCE PUBLIC WORKING GROUP (PWWG)

Co-Chair: Dylan Gilbert, NIST Privacy Policy Advisor

MONTHLY MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday, January 10, 2024
1:00 P.M. ET – 2:00 P.M. ET

I.   INTRODUCTION

The 31st meeting of the National Institute of Standards and Technology (NIST) Privacy Workforce Public Working Group (PWWG) convened on Wednesday, January 10th from 1:00 P.M. - 2:00 P.M. ET virtually via Microsoft Teams. There were 37 attendees.

The PWWG provides a forum for participants from the public, including private industry, the public sector, academia, and civil society, to create the content of the NIST Privacy Workforce Taxonomy. The PWWG is tasked with creating Task, Knowledge, and Skill (TKS) Statements aligned with the NIST Privacy Framework and the National Initiative for Cybersecurity Education (NICE) Workforce Framework for Cybersecurity.

PWWG Co-Chair, Dylan Gilbert, welcomed attendees to the meeting.

II.   PWWG UPDATE

The PWWG is in transition to the final three working groups. The first Project Team 10 meeting takes place right after this meeting. Project Team 11 had their first meeting yesterday and Project Team 9 has been meeting since early November.

Dylan wished the PWWG members a Happy New Year and noted how nice it is to be back. He looks forward to finishing the work this year. On behalf of Dylan and all the PWWG Co-Chairs, a sincere thank you to all the PWWG participants who have helped create the material thus far. The high quality of work performed in this working group over the past few years is owed completely to the PWWG members and the strength of everyone's expertise as well as the time members have taken out of their busy schedules to participate. The Co-Chairs are grateful for everyone's time as we come down to the finish line.

The PWWG has over a thousand members from all over the world. Eight project teams have already finished, and the final three teams are now up and running. Over 700 Task, Knowledge and Skill Statements have been created thus far, which are very close to final form. A few hundred more will come out of the last group of Project Teams. There will likely be over 1000 Task, Knowledge, and Skills Statements once finalized if the Baseline TKS Statements are included as well. It will be a hefty work product that will be very valuable to our profession. For any new members, the PWWG website has an archive of monthly minutes. Anyone can join a project team which would also enable access to the individual team materials. Dylan acknowledged the NIST team for all their hard work.

A.   PWWG TIMELINE UPDATE

The PWWG will be wrapping up the project teams in March. There are ten weeks remaining to finish the work. It is a fast-paced and aspirational timeline. Dylan is very confident it can be done. It will be incumbent on us as members to participate both in the meetings and outside of the meetings. Members can always weigh in through their comments and feedback in between meetings by providing comments in the workbooks. Members can also send communication through the various listservs set up for each Project Team. Try to make the meetings if you can, but if not, please offer your thoughts in comments or via the listservs.

The final Project Teams, PT9, PT10, and PT11 will be working on the remaining Subcategories which will run

from January through March 2024. The teams may need to work on a weekly basis instead of the biweekly cadence of the previous teams.

> PT9 Data Processing Awareness (CM.AW-P) - 8 Subcategories
> PT10 Monitoring and Review (GV.MT-P) - 7 Subcategories
> PT11 Disassociated Processing (CT.DP-P) - 5 Subcategories

The intention is to release the initial Privacy Workforce Taxonomy Public Draft in April 2024 at which point it will be opened for a public comment period. While we are finalizing the TKS Statements coming out of the Project Teams, NIST wants to ensure that the public can weigh in on the material created so it is a true multi-stakeholder endeavor. Once the work is finished from the last three teams, any additional material will be written up that may be part of this. Additional material may include front matter, a narrative, as well as any appendices that are required to create the public draft and open it up for public comment.

When the public comment period closes and NIST has an opportunity to adjudicate the comments, Version 1.0 of the Privacy Workforce Taxonomy will then be published. Version 1.0 will be published targeting the Summer of 2024. The project was started in April 2021 making it a three-year endeavor.

III. PROJECT TEAM UPDATES

A. UPDATE OF PROJECT TEAM 6: RISK MANAGEMENT STRATEGY

GOVERN-P (GV-P): Develop and implement the organizational governance structure to enable an ongoing understanding of the organization's risk management priorities that are informed by privacy risk.

- **Risk Management Strategy (GV.RM-P)**: The organization's priorities, constraints, risk tolerances, and assumptions are established and used to support operational risk decisions.

  o **GV.RM-P1:** Risk management processes are established, managed, and agreed to by organizational stakeholders.
  o **GV.RM-P2**: Organizational risk tolerance is determined and clearly expressed.
  o **GV.RM-P3**: The organization's determination of risk tolerance is informed by its role(s) in the data processing ecosystem.

Dylan provided the update for Project Team 6. Dana Garbo, Chief Privacy Officer, Medline Industries and James Koons, Founding Partner, Data Privacy & Security Advisors lead Project Team 6 through their work. The Risk Management Strategy category is a foundational category when you are thinking about doing Privacy Risk Management. The Team has completed all its proposals. The Co-Chairs have reviewed all the material. The Co-Leads and Dylan will meet next week to review the Co-Chairs feedback and get their material finalized.

Dana Garbo thanked everyone who was a part of their team and contributed to the work. She encouraged the PWWG members to join the remaining Project Teams.

Dylan noted that the PWWG Team will archive all the Project Team 6 material and update the Compilation document with the Project Team 6 TKS Statements once finalized.

B. UPDATE OF PROJECT TEAM 8: DATA PROCESSING MANAGEMENT (CT.DM-P)

CONTROL-P (CT-P): Develop and implement appropriate activities to enable organizations or individuals to manage data with sufficient granularity to manage privacy risks.

- **Data Processing Management (CT.DM-P)**: Data are managed consistent with the organization's risk strategy to protect individuals' privacy, increase manageability, and enable the implementation of privacy principles (e.g., individual participation, data quality, data minimization).

- CT.DM-P1: Data elements can be accessed for review.
  - CT.DM-P2: Data elements can be accessed for transmission or disclosure.
  - CT.DM-P3: Data elements can be accessed for alteration.
  - CT.DM-P4: Data elements can be accessed for deletion.
  - CT.DM-P5: Data are destroyed according to policy.
  - CT.DM-P6: Data are transmitted using standardized formats.
  - CT.DM-P7: Mechanisms for transmitting processing permissions and related data values with data elements are established and in place.
  - CT.DM-P8: Audit/log records are determined, documented, implemented, and reviewed in accordance with policy and incorporating the principle of data minimization.
  - CT.DM-P9: Technical measures implemented to manage data processing are tested and assessed.
  - CT.DM-P10: Stakeholder privacy preferences are included in algorithmic design objectives and outputs are evaluated against these preferences.

Dylan provided the update for Project Team 8 (PT8). Project Team 8 leads, Abhinav (Abby) Palia, Ridwan Badmus, and Nikita Samarin have been incredible leaders walking members through this very technical Subcategory. They have completed all their work. The Co-Chairs are meeting tomorrow to review the CT.DM-P9 and CT.DM-P10 material. The group will hold ad-hoc meetings to review finalized TKS Statements, if necessary, should any debates arise to the level that it needs to be brought back to the team.

C. **UPDATE OF PROJECT TEAM 9: DATA PROCESSING AWARENESS (CM.AW-P)**

COMMUNICATE-P (CM-P): Develop and implement appropriate activities to enable organizations or individuals to manage data with sufficient granularity to manage privacy risks.

- **Data Processing Awareness (CM.AW-P):** Individuals and organizations have reliable knowledge about data processing practices and associated privacy risks, and effective mechanisms are used and maintained to increase predictability consistent with the organization's risk strategy to protect individuals' privacy.

  - **CM.AW-P1:** Mechanisms (e.g., notices, internal or public reports) for communicating data processing purposes, practices, associated privacy risks, and options for enabling individuals' data processing preferences and requests are established and in place.
  - **CM.AW-P2:** Mechanisms for obtaining feedback from individuals (e.g., surveys or focus groups) about data processing and associated privacy risks are established and in place.
  - **CM.AW-P3:** System/product/service design enables data processing visibility.
  - **CM.AW-P4:** Records of data disclosures and sharing are maintained and can be accessed for review or transmission/disclosure.
  - **CM.AW-P5:** Data corrections or deletions can be communicated to individuals or organizations (e.g., data sources) in the data processing ecosystem.
  - **CM.AW-P6:** Data provenance and lineage are maintained and can be accessed for review or transmission/disclosure.
  - **CM.AW-P7:** Impacted individuals and organizations are notified about a privacy breach or event.
  - **CM.AW-P8:** Individuals are provided with mitigation mechanisms (e.g., credit monitoring, consent withdrawal, data alteration or deletion) to address impacts of problematic data actions.

Co-Lead Stuart Lee provided the update for Project Team 9 (PT9). Stuart thanked everyone who attended the meeting prior to the Holidays as well as for anyone who provided comments in the workbook. PT9 finished CM.AW-P1 and is almost finished with CM.AW-P2. The team will begin working on CM.AW-P3 very soon as well as start to pick up the pace of work. The Team Leads will meet this Friday or the following

Monday to work on additional Statements. They are confident they will hit the deadlines in front of them.

Dylan inquired about what has taken the most time for debate or time thus far. The accelerator has been the availability of the Baseline. Some conversations have oscillated around internal vs. external stakeholders. Who is the recipient of this awareness and making sure the language reflects that? The team is also thinking a lot about conflicting or adjacent requirements around accessibility to make sure you are meeting additional requirements that go beyond privacy. It is always difficult to not stuff the parentheticals.

There has been great engagement from the group. The Co-Leads welcome anyone who is interested to join them on the team.

D. UPDATE OF PROJECT TEAM 10: MONITORING AND REVIEW (GV.MT-P)

GOVERN-P (GV-P): Develop and implement the organizational governance structure to enable an ongoing understanding of the organization's risk management priorities that are informed by privacy risk.

- **Monitoring and Review (GV.MT-P):** The policies, processes, and procedures for ongoing review of the organization's privacy posture are understood and inform the management of privacy risk.

    o **GV.MT-P1:** Privacy risk is re-evaluated on an ongoing basis and as key factors, including the organization's business environment (e.g., introduction of new technologies), governance (e.g., legal obligations, risk tolerance), data processing, and systems/products/services change.
    o **GV.MT-P2:** Privacy values, policies, and training are reviewed and any updates are communicated.
    o **GV.MT-P3:** Policies, processes, and procedures for assessing compliance with legal requirements and privacy policies are established and in place.
    o **GV.MT-P4:** Policies, processes, and procedures for communicating progress on managing privacy risks are established and in place.
    o **GV.MT-P5:** Policies, processes, and procedures are established and in place to receive, analyze, and respond to problematic data actions disclosed to the organization from internal and external sources (e.g., internal discovery, privacy researchers, professional events).
    o **GV.MT-P6:** Policies, processes, and procedures incorporate lessons learned from problematic data actions.
    o **GV.MT-P7:** Policies, processes, and procedures for receiving, tracking, and responding to complaints, concerns, and questions from individuals about organizational privacy practices are established and in place.

Project Team 10 (PT10) Co-Lead, Catherine Tomasi, spoke for the group. Robert Taboada and Phil Lowry are also leading the team. The Co-Leads are very excited to kick-off Project Team 10 this afternoon. The leads come at this work from lots of different areas of expertise. The Leads have used the Baseline as a jump off point. They feel stronger around a difficult Subcategory but are ready for discussion. They feel confident that they will quickly go through the remaining Subcategories.

Dylan noted that the Subcategories are more like variations on a theme. They are meeting today at 2:00pm ET today. All are welcome to join the team.

E. UPDATE OF PROJECT TEAM 11: DISSASSOCIATED PROCESSING (CT.DP-P)

CONTROL-P (CT-P): Develop and implement appropriate activities to enable organizations or individuals to manage data with sufficient granularity to manage privacy risks.

- **Disassociated Processing (CT.DP-P):** Data processing solutions increase disassociability consistent with the organization's risk strategy to protect individuals' privacy and enable implementation of privacy principles

(e.g., data minimization).

- o **CT.DP-P1:** Data are processed to limit observability and link ability (e.g., data actions take place on local devices, privacy-preserving cryptography).
- o **CT.DP-P2:** Data are processed to limit the identification of individuals (e.g., de-identification privacy techniques, tokenization).
- o **CT.DP-P3:** Data are processed to limit the formulation of inferences about individuals' behavior or activities (e.g., data processing is decentralized, distributed architectures).
- o **CT.DP-P4:** System or device configurations permit selective collection or disclosure of data elements.
- o **CT.DP-P5:** Attribute references are substituted for attribute values.

Sarah Cortes, Sri Maddipati, and Hank Roser are leading Project Team 11 (PT11). Hank Roser provided the update for the team. The PT11 kicked off yesterday and reviewed some initial data. The team came up with a plan of action for the next three weeks. The leads hope to have some great engagement to carry them through the next few weeks.

IV. Q & A

Question: Will you be publishing another compilation document?

Answer: Yes. We have been iteratively building up a compilation document of all the material that has been finalized within our project teams. The NIST team just reviewed Version 6.0 and found a few errors. We are fixing those errors and will then fold in the material from Project Teams 6, 7 and 8. At a minimum we will have one more version that captures the material from Project Teams 1-8. The draft Baseline will likely be included in that as well. If anyone has thoughts on whether they would like to see the Baseline in draft form in the compilation documents let Dylan know. The Baseline is included within the workbooks for the last three Project Teams, but it is not currently in the compilation document.

Question: For the final review, will the PWWG publish an excel version of TKS Statements?

Answer: Yes, absolutely. It will be the standard issue from NIST to make it as user friendly as possible. It is currently in PDF so that we can manage the document control.

A member based in Australia expressed their sincere appreciation for the work of the PWWG. Australia is undergoing a significant privacy reform that will totally change everything that everyone is doing. All the work that has been done will be critical in helping professionals in Australia.

V. NEXT STEPS & UPCOMING MEETINGS

A. UPCOMING MEETINGS

The upcoming meetings of the NIST PWWG and its Project Teams are noted below. For further information, including updated meeting schedules, meeting minutes, agendas, and slide deck please visit the PWWG web page.

Project Team 9 (PT9)
- Meeting: Thursday, January 11, 2023, | 2:00pm – 3:00pm ET

Project Team 10 (PT10)
- Meeting: January 10, 2024

Project Team 11 (PT11)
- Meeting: January 23, 2024

NIST Privacy Workforce Public Working Group
- Wednesday, February 14, 2024, | 1:00pm – 2:00pm ET

B. NEW BUSINESS OPEN TOPICS

New Business Open Discussion Topics Drop Box is available on the [NIST Privacy Workforce Working Group](#) webpage. If you are interested in presenting a business topic during a PWWG Monthly Meeting, please visit the webpage noted above.

C. TROUBLESHOOTING

If you have any technical issues with meeting invitations, mailing lists, and/or accessing the Google Drives, please email NIST PWWG Support at [PWWG@nist.gov.](mailto:PWWG@nist.gov)

D. JOIN MAILING LIST

To join one of the Project Teams you must subscribe to its associated mailing list. All mailing lists are moderated. Please be reminded to adhere to the Mailing List Rules that can be found on the [NIST Privacy Workforce Working Group](#) website.

- PWWG: PrivacyWorkforceWG+subscribe@list.nist.gov
- PT9 (CM.AW-P): PrivacyWorkforcePT9+subscribe@list.nist.gov
- PT10 (GV.MT-P): PrivacyWorkforcePT10+subscribe@list.nist.gov
- PT11 (CT.DP-P): PrivacyWorkforcePT11+subscribe@list.nist.gov