

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹ / # (e.g. FBI/1)	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition LEAVE THIS COLUMN BLANK
					quality requirement needed to meet the severe security risk levels... “	
NPIA/ 20	6.5.5	BAP Implementation – Table 3	ed	The use of BAP levels in this doc is not very clear. Are the numbers down the LHS of Table 3 the BAP Levels? – if so it would help to put this in the column heading.	Define clearly what is the BAP level. Is it Column 1?	Remove the first column that contains “No.” The numbers were not originally intended to be levels. Each entry links risk and function. Refer to DHS 72 below for table restructuring.
ITAL/ 7	6.5.5	Table 3	Te	During the previous meeting, ITALDATA proposed to revise this table, in order to allow the use of SAP Level 10 devices for identification (see comment ITAL/3, page 18 of the previous meeting comments), and also other agencies noted that they are already using this kind of devices for identification. It was agreed that the entire table had to be revised: however the revised Table 3 does not include the proposed change. We propose to allow, at least as an interim solution, to be removed in the future, the use of SAP Level 10 devices for identification.	In Row 8 of the Table (Use Case: Mild/Identification) change the SAP Level to 10+.	Accept. Change SAP level to 10 + in row 8.
ITAL/ 8	6.5.5	Table 3	Te	In rows 2 and 5 of the Table (Use cases: Severe/Identification and Moderate/Identification) it is recommended to use four or more fingers. Some AFIS System only use two fingers for identification	In rows 2 and 5, in the “# of Fingers” column, replace “4+” with “4+ if the receiving system is able to manage four fingers, 2+ otherwise”.	Reject.

1 MB = Member Body or Organization (enter 2-4 letter abbreviation)

2 Type of comment: ge = minor general Ge = major general te =minor technical Te =major technical ed = minor editorial Ed = major editorial. (Take care of Word changing te to Te etc.

NOTE 1 Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory. If column 4 is ge, use ge in column two also (and leave column 3 blank) if it applies to the whole document.

NOTE 2 MBs should not change the width of columns, in order to make merging easier.

Note 3 Please submit this document in .doc format and NOT .pdf

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹ / # (e.g. FBI/1)	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition LEAVE THIS COLUMN BLANK
				(and cannot use more since they have only two fingers in the search engines). The number of fingers in these use cases should be “4+” only if the receiving system is able to manage four fingers. If not, it should be possible to capture and transmit only two fingerprints, also to avoid unnecessary bandwidth usage.		
DHS/T SA72	6.5.5	Table 3	ed	The layout of this table as 9 numbered rows is not as intuitive or informative as a 3x3 arrangement, which would allow visual scanning across and down to see the changes in SAP and number of fingers by either constant function or constant risk. NOTE – this style if adopted should be used for all modalities.	See alternative layout – at the bottom of the comments. These two tables could be combined into one, but it may be too busy. The second table could also be purely narrative clauses, no table.	Accept Add a note line at bottom of table. See last page. Two tables will replace one.
DHS/T SA73	6.5.5	Table 3 row #2	te	Terminology for multi-modal and correction in function to IDENTIFICATION	Change “ multi- modal biometric verification” To “ multi-biometric fusion for identification “	Partial Accept Change to: “ multi- modal biometric identification“
DHS/T SA74	6.5.5	Table 3 row #3	te	Terminology for multi-modal	Change “ multi- modal biometric verification” To “ multi-biometric fusion for verification “	Reject
DHS/T SA75	6.5.5	Table 3 row #5	ed	Capitalization not needed	Change “ Mobile Identification” To “ mobile identification “	Accept.
FBI-V 10	Page 22	Table 3	ed	Extra slash after 30+ in No. 5 – Sap Levels		Accept.

1 MB = Member Body or Organization (enter 2-4 letter abbreviation)

2 Type of comment: ge = minor general Ge = major general te =minor technical Te =major technical ed = minor editorial Ed = major editorial. (Take care of Word changing te to Te etc.

NOTE 1 Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory. If column 4 is ge, use ge in column two also (and leave column 3 blank) if it applies to the whole document.

NOTE 2 MBs should not change the width of columns, in order to make merging easier.

Note 3 Please submit this document in .doc format and NOT .pdf

Title: Comments on: MobileID Device BPR - 20080916

Date: October 28, 2008	Document: Approved Proposed Resolution of Comments
------------------------	--

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹ / # (e.g. FBI/1)	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition LEAVE THIS COLUMN BLANK
FBI-V 11	Page 22	Table 3	ed	“enrol” should be enrolment in No. 4 and No. 7		Accept.
DHS/T SA76	6.5.5	Para 1 sentence 2	ed	Plural needed	Change “ Device“ To “ Devices “	Accept.
FBI-V 12	Page 23	Sentence after table	ed	“Device” should be “Devices”		Accept.
DHS/T SA77	7	Title	ed	Use same form for all titles	Change To “ Mobile ID Facial Image Capture Devices “	Accept.
DHS/T SA78	7.1	Para 1 sentence 1	ed	Usage of “mobile identification”	Change “ Mobile Identification “ To “ Mobile ID “	Accept.
DHS/T SA79	7.1	Para 1 list item 2	ed	The purpose in this entry is purely the Identification	Change “ Mobile Identification “ To “ Identification “	Accept.
FBI -V 13	Page 23	7.1 – 4 th para	ed	Need space after “30,”		Accept.
DHS/T SA80	7.1	Last Para last sentence	ed	The term “user” may be incorrect here. If the information is to be used immediately to make an additional capture attempt, then the person to be informed is the “operator”	Change “user” To “operator”	Accept. Refer to DHS3
NPIA/ 21	7.1	Overview – final para	ed	The para starts with ‘As is the case with fingerprints, the mobile device mustmeasure face image quality’ However, for fingerprints measuring image quality in	Make this section (and iris quality – 8.1) consistent with fingerprints (6.1) The requirement is for the operator to be provided with (real time) feedback on the quality of the captured images. Common sense says this is best done on the device	Accept To be fashioned similar to response in L1 1.

1 MB = Member Body or Organization (enter 2-4 letter abbreviation)

2 Type of comment: ge = minor general Ge = major general te =minor technical Te =major technical ed = minor editorial Ed = major editorial. (Take care of Word changing te to Te etc.

NOTE 1 Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory. If column 4 is ge, use ge in column two also (and leave column 3 blank) if it applies to the whole document.

NOTE 2 MBs should not change the width of columns, in order to make merging easier.

Note 3 Please submit this document in .doc format and NOT .pdf

Title: Comments on: MobileID Device BPR - 20080916

Date: October 28, 2008	Document: Approved Proposed Resolution of Comments
------------------------	--

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹ / # (e.g. FBI/1)	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition LEAVE THIS COLUMN BLANK
				the device is only one of several options for measuring quality. (But note my suggested re-wording)	but it doesn't have to be.	
DHS/T SA81	7.2.1	Para 1 sentence 1	ed	Usage of "mobile identification" - capitalization unnecessary	Change " Mobile Identification " To " mobile identification "	Accept.
DHS/T SA82	7.2.1	Para1 sentences 2 and 3	ed	Avoid the term "user" when referring to the Operator of the device – 4 instances	Change " user " To " operator " 4 instances	Accept. Refer to DHS 3
DHS/T SA83	7.2.1	Para 2 sentence 1	te	The requirement for "ear-to-ear photograph" is not included in Table 4, there is no corresponding entry in table 4 entitled "Camera Focal Length"	Create an entry in Table 4 to include this concept (<i>editor or designate authorized to compose entry for next draft</i>)	Noted: Change the name of 7.2.1 to Capture Distance. Change: Cameras used in facial recognition in mobile ID should have 2 to 6 feet separation between the camera and the subject. and Delete last paragraph of 7.2.1.
NPIA/ 22	7.2.2	Camera Controls	te	What is 'Auto Contrast'? Surely this should be 'Auto Exposure' or just plain 'Auto'	Replace auto contrast with 'auto exposure' or 'auto'	Accept
DHS/T	7.2.2 –	entire	Te	The titles in 7.2.1 through 7.2.7 should be aligned	<i>The editor or designate is authorized to</i>	Accept.

1 MB = Member Body or Organization (enter 2-4 letter abbreviation)

2 Type of comment: ge = minor general Ge = major general te =minor technical Te =major technical ed = minor editorial Ed = major editorial. (Take care of Word changing te to Te etc.

NOTE 1 Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory. If column 4 is ge, use ge in column two also (and leave column 3 blank) if it applies to the whole document.

NOTE 2 MBs should not change the width of columns, in order to make merging easier.

Note 3 Please submit this document in .doc format and NOT .pdf

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹ / # (e.g. FBI/1)	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition LEAVE THIS COLUMN BLANK
SA84	7.2.7 and Table 4			with the first column terms in Table 4. Note the “camera” used in 7.2.x while “capture device” is used in the table. Also the order of appearance should be consistent.	<i>harmonize these entries.</i>	
DHS/T SA85	7.2.2	Para 1 sentence 1	ed	The term “user” may be incorrect here.	Change “user” To “operator”	Accept Refer to DHS 3
DHS/T SA86	7.2.2	Para 1 sentence 1	te	There is a disagreement between this “auto contrast” and the table entry – capture device controls, that addresses auto gain, auto shutter,...	<i>Harmonize this clause with the contents of the table (not sure what is the correct solution)</i>	Accept
NPIA/ 23	7.2.4	Photo Image Format	te	Current FR algorithms tend to work with gray scale images. Will this still be the case in 2010?	For a document looking toward 2010 I would suggest recommending colour over G/S.	Noted Delete: “For facial recognition eight bit gray scale images can be used.”
FBI-V 14	7.2.4		Ed	Need to add “minimum of” to the first sentence		Accept.
FBI-V 15	Table 4		ed	Table is missing top line and has a blank row. Also should use lower case “pxl” in the row inter-eye distance (col 40 & 51)		Accept.
DHS/T SA87	7.2.4 and Table 4	Para 1 sentence 1	te	This paragraph cites “in compressed format” but the related table entry “Capture Device Color Space” does not speak to compression	Change here or table 4 to deal with (or not) image compression	Accept. Remove “compressed” from 7.2.4. Refer to ANSI/NIST std.

1 MB = Member Body or Organization (enter 2-4 letter abbreviation)

2 Type of comment: ge = minor general Ge = major general te =minor technical Te =major technical ed = minor editorial Ed = major editorial. (Take care of Word changing te to Te etc.

NOTE 1 Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory. If column 4 is ge, use ge in column two also (and leave column 3 blank) if it applies to the whole document.

NOTE 2 MBs should not change the width of columns, in order to make merging easier.

Note 3 Please submit this document in .doc format and NOT .pdf

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹ / # (e.g. FBI/1)	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition LEAVE THIS COLUMN BLANK
DHS/T SA88	7.2.6 and table 4	entire	te	This paragraph has no corresponding entry in Table 4	Either delete this clause or create an entry into table 4 to address this topic	Accept. Add a new line to table 4.
DHS/T SA89	Missing clauses		Te	By comparison with the fingerprint section, this section is missing two sections, the parallel to 6.3 Interchange Requirements and 6.4 Security Requirements	<i>Determine if these are needed here. If so, the editor or designate is authorized to prepare new text for the next draft.</i>	Accept. Add a 7.3.1 to address type 10 records. See 6.3.2. Refer to DHS 46 above
Sagem/ 14	7.3	Table 5	ed	On Severe Enrollment USE CASE example, remove last sentence "Enrolling all fingers provided additional search capability". Sentence not applicable to face.	Remove last sentence.	Accept.
DHS/T SA90	7.3	Para 2 entire	ed	This material is better suited in the Overview	Move entire paragraph – insert as the first paragraph in 7.1	Accept. Merge with last paragraph
DHS/T SA91	7.3	Para 2 sentence 2	ed	Use of the abbreviation ID is not accurate – change to authentication, or possibly identification/verification?	Change "Capturing facial images provides a non-contact form of ID for situations " To: "Capturing facial images provides a non-contact form of authentication for situations "	Accept. Change to 'identification/verification' in the first sentence.
FBI-V 16	Table 5		ed	Use case in No. 1 and 7 reference fingerprint and it should be face. Also, No. 4 and 7 should say "enrolment".		Accept. A face ad hoc group formed to address unanswered face issues consisting of:

1 MB = Member Body or Organization (enter 2-4 letter abbreviation)

2 Type of comment: ge = minor general Ge = major general te =minor technical Te =major technical ed = minor editorial Ed = major editorial. (Take care of Word changing te to Te etc.

NOTE 1 Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory. If column 4 is ge, use ge in column two also (and leave column 3 blank) if it applies to the whole document.

NOTE 2 MBs should not change the width of columns, in order to make merging easier.

Note 3 Please submit this document in .doc format and NOT .pdf

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹ / # (e.g. FBI/1)	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition LEAVE THIS COLUMN BLANK
						Udo Mahlmeister, Brad Wing, Peter Higgins, TJ Smith, Greg Cannon, & Mike McCabe. Table 5 never corrected or completed after the June meeting.
DHS/T SA92	7.3	Table 5 title	ed	“Format” is not the correct term	Change “ Format“ To “ Function “	Accept. But see DHS 2
NPIA/ 24	Table 5	Face Use cases	te	This section does not appear to have progressed since the last draft and still references fingers.		Accept. Refer to FBI-V 16 above.
DHS/T SA93	7.3	Table 5 entire	Te	Content missing, copied from Fingerprint	<i>Populate this critical table with face-related information parallel to Table 3</i>	Accept. Refer to FBI-V 16 above.
DHS/T SA94	8.	Title	ed	The titles for section 6, 7 and 8 should all be aligned. Recommend the style: “Mobile ID (<i>specific modality</i>) Capture Devices”	Change “ Iris Image Capture Devices “ To “ Mobile ID Iris Image Capture Devices “	Accept
FBI-C 7	8.1	Pg. 29	ed	References SAP level 30, 40, and 51 but Table 6 SAP levels are defined as 20, 30, and 40.		Accept. Change text to 20, 30, 40
DHS/T SA95	8.1	Para 1 sentence 1	Te	The SAP level identifiers are not consistent with Table 6	Change “ 30, 40 & 51“ To “ 20, 30 & 40“	Accept. Refer to FBI-C 7
DHS/T SA96	8.1	Para 2 sentence 2	ed	The term “user” may be incorrect here.	Change “user” To “operator”	Accept. Refer to DHS 3

1 MB = Member Body or Organization (enter 2-4 letter abbreviation)

2 Type of comment: ge = minor general Ge = major general te =minor technical Te =major technical ed = minor editorial Ed = major editorial. (Take care of Word changing te to Te etc.

NOTE 1 Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory. If column 4 is ge, use ge in column two also (and leave column 3 blank) if it applies to the whole document.

NOTE 2 MBs should not change the width of columns, in order to make merging easier.

Note 3 Please submit this document in .doc format and NOT .pdf

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹ / # (e.g. FBI/1)	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition LEAVE THIS COLUMN BLANK
FBI-V 18	Table 6		ed	Blank Row at top of table and lower section does not have lines between each row.		Accept.
DHS/T SA97	8.2	title	ed	Plural required	Change “ Requirement“ To “ Requirements “	Accept.
DHS/T SA98	8.2.1	Para 1 sentence 1	ed	Usage of “mobile identification” - capitalization unnecessary	Change “ Mobile Identification “ To “ mobile identification “	Accept.
DHS/T SA99	8.2.1	Para 1 sentences 2-3	ed	The term “user” may be incorrect here. All 3 instances	Change “user” To “operator”	Accept. Refer to DHS 3
DHS/T SA100	8.2.x	entire	Te	Entries are needed in this clause to correspond with table 6, at least for rows in table 6 that vary across SAP level	Call for contributions needed	Accept. Ad hoc group formed to address Iris issues; Udo Mahlmeister, Greg Cannon, Rick Lazarick, Charles Wilson, Mike McCabe
DHS/T SA101	Missing clauses		Te	By comparison with the fingerprint section, this section is missing two sections, the parallel to 6.3 Interchange Requirements and 6.4 Security Requirements	<i>Determine if these are needed here. If so, the editor or designate is authorized to prepare new text for the next draft.</i>	Partial Accept Remove matching from table 6.

1 MB = Member Body or Organization (enter 2-4 letter abbreviation)

2 Type of comment: ge = minor general Ge = major general te =minor technical Te =major technical ed = minor editorial Ed = major editorial. (Take care of Word changing te to Te etc.)

NOTE 1 Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory. If column 4 is ge, use ge in column two also (and leave column 3 blank) if it applies to the whole document.

NOTE 2 MBs should not change the width of columns, in order to make merging easier.

Note 3 Please submit this document in .doc format and NOT .pdf

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹ / # (e.g. FBI/1)	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition LEAVE THIS COLUMN BLANK
						Refer to type-17 record.
DHS/T SA102	8.3	entire	Te	This paragraph is not iris related (copy from face??)	<i>Call for contributions needed</i>	Accept. To be addressed by ad hoc group refer to DHS 100. Fix "ditto" on table 6, column 2.
FBI-V 17	Page 29 8.3		Ed	3 rd sentence references face instead of Iris.		To be addressed by ad hoc group refer to DHS 100.
DHS/T SA103	8.3	Table 6 title	ed	Misspelling	Change " Requirments " To " Requirements "	Accept.
DHS/T SA104	8.3	Table 6	te	Consider adding rows that address illuminator wavelength and illumination intensity	<i>Call for contributions needed</i>	Reject
FBI-V 19	Table 7		ed	Margin is cut of on the right hand side or boarder is missing. Also No. 4 and 7 should be "enrolment".		Accept Refer to DHS 72
DHS/T SA105	8.3	Table 7 row #3	te	The number of eyes column indicates 1+ needed for this use case, yet the SAP level 40 requires 2. Is this a significant disagreement? If both are required to be captured and are available, then both will be used, so it would seem most logical to indicate 2 rather than 1+	Change in row #3 " 1+ " To " 2 "	Reject. Make a general table that has examples of severity of risk vs. functions. Ambika Suman will develop a table and for-

1 MB = Member Body or Organization (enter 2-4 letter abbreviation)

2 Type of comment: ge = minor general Ge = major general te =minor technical Te =major technical ed = minor editorial Ed = major editorial. (Take care of Word changing te to Te etc.

NOTE 1 Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory. If column 4 is ge, use ge in column two also (and leave column 3 blank) if it applies to the whole document.

NOTE 2 MBs should not change the width of columns, in order to make merging easier.

Note 3 Please submit this document in .doc format and NOT .pdf

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹ / # (e.g. FBI/1)	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition LEAVE THIS COLUMN BLANK
						ward to Peter Komarinski, Peter Higgins, TJ Smith, & Mike McCabe. Comments are requested from the above individuals.
FBI-J 3	9	Para 1	ed	Replace re with are		Accept
FBI-V 20	Page 31 Section 9		ed	Several extra spaces between words and “re” should be “are”.		Accept
FBI-V 21	Page 32	Para 3	ed	Missing “the” between “could be” and “use of”.		Accept
FBI-V 22	Page 33	3 rd bullet in second list	te	What is the benefit of returning images to the field?		Reject Merge paragraphs on pp 32 and 31 addressing candidate list vs. different types of records/images. User requires images.
Sagem/ 15	9.0	Page 32, 3 rd paragraph (after last bullet)	ed	Consistency in the use of ‘Mobile ID’ and ‘Mobile-ID’	Change ‘Mobile-ID’ to ‘Mobile ID’	Accept
Sagem/ 16	9.0	Page 32, 4 th paragraph	ed	Consistency in the use of ‘Mobile ID’ and ‘Mobile-ID’	Change ‘Mobile-ID’ to ‘Mobile ID’	Accept

1 MB = Member Body or Organization (enter 2-4 letter abbreviation)

2 Type of comment: ge = minor general Ge = major general te =minor technical Te =major technical ed = minor editorial Ed = major editorial. (Take care of Word changing te to Te etc.

NOTE 1 Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory. If column 4 is ge, use ge in column two also (and leave column 3 blank) if it applies to the whole document.

NOTE 2 MBs should not change the width of columns, in order to make merging easier.

Note 3 Please submit this document in .doc format and NOT .pdf

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹ / # (e.g. FBI/1)	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition LEAVE THIS COLUMN BLANK
FBI-C 8	9	Pg. 32 Bullet 2	ed	What is the difference between a wanted individual and a subject with outstanding wants and warrants?		Noted Change “wanted individuals” to “individuals of interest”.
FBI-C 9	10.1	Pg. 33, 34	Ed	Editorial Comments such as “unless actions are taken to secure this information and its transmission, the mobile device will represent a potentially greater risk”...(paragraph 2) should be removed.	Statement should be made to follow the security policy dictated by the biometric database you are searching	Accept
DHS/T SA107	10.1	Para 4 last sentence	ed	The term “user” may be incorrect here.	Change “user” To “operator”	Accept Refer to DHS 3
NPIA/ 25	10.1	Overview – end of first para	te’agencies must developsecurity policies’ should be changed to something like ‘agencies must adopt nationally agreed ...security policies’ Any system is only as secure as the weakest link in the chain. As this BPR is designed to enable interoperability, all agencies should ensure they meet agreed standards, and should not develop their own.	Replace ‘develop..policies’ with “adopt nationally agreed / recognised...policies”.	Reject
ITAL/ 9	10.2		Te	The referenced FIPS 140-2 standards are US specific. It could be difficult for a non-US supplier to obtain FIPS certification, and some non-US agencies could require compliance to different security standards.	In 10.2, specify that for US based agencies, the FIPS standards are the ones to be used, while in other countries the agencies could require compliance to different standards that provide an equivalent level of security.	Accept Add a note to the text or incorporate into 10.2.1
NPIA/ 26	10.3.1	User Authenticati	te	Does it matter which biometric is used as the second factor? Some are more ‘secure’ than others	Reword as ‘one of which should be a biometric, providing the total level of user	Accept

1 MB = Member Body or Organization (enter 2-4 letter abbreviation)

2 Type of comment: ge = minor general Ge = major general te =minor technical Te =major technical ed = minor editorial Ed = major editorial. (Take care of Word changing te to Te etc.

NOTE 1 Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory. If column 4 is ge, use ge in column two also (and leave column 3 blank) if it applies to the whole document.

NOTE 2 MBs should not change the width of columns, in order to make merging easier.

Note 3 Please submit this document in .doc format and NOT .pdf

Title: Comments on: MobileID Device BPR - 20080916

Date: October 28, 2008	Document: Approved Proposed Resolution of Comments
------------------------	--

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹ / # (e.g. FBI/1)	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition LEAVE THIS COLUMN BLANK
		on		and in some cases a biometric may not even be appropriate or as secure as (say) a user-id / PIN / password / smartcard combination	authentication provided complies with agreed security policies'	Change may to "should"
DHS/T SA108	10.3.1	Title	ed	The term "user" may be incorrect here.	Change "User" To "Operator"	Accept Refer to DHS 3
DHS/T SA109	10.3.1	Para 1 sentence 1	ed	The term "user" may be incorrect here.	Change " a user" To " an operator"	Accept Refer to DHS 3
FBI-V 23	Page 35	10.3.2	ed	Missing period at the end of the sentence		Accept
DHS/T SA110	10.3.2	Para 1 sentence 1	ed	The term "user" may be incorrect here.	Change "user" To "operator"	Accept Refer to DHS 3
DHS/T SA111	10.3.3	Para 1 sentence 1	ed	The term "user" may be incorrect here.	Change "user" To "operator"	Accept Refer to DHS 3
DHS/T SA112	10.3.4	Para 1 sentence 1	ed	The term "user" may be incorrect here.	Change "user" To "operator"	Accept Refer to DHS 3
DHS/T SA113	10.3.7	Para 1 sentence 1	ed	The term "user" may be incorrect here.	Change "user" To "operator"	Accept Refer to DHS 3
ITAL/ 10	10.3.7		te	The concept of "Device Authentication" should be explained in more detail. Does this mean that every Mobile ID device should have a unique ID and that the central system should be able to manage a "black list" of devices (for example lost or stolen)	Add more detail.	Discussed. Add a 2 nd sentence .

1 MB = Member Body or Organization (enter 2-4 letter abbreviation)

2 Type of comment: ge = minor general Ge = major general te =minor technical Te =major technical ed = minor editorial Ed = major editorial. (Take care of Word changing te to Te etc.

NOTE 1 Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory. If column 4 is ge, use ge in column two also (and leave column 3 blank) if it applies to the whole document.

NOTE 2 MBs should not change the width of columns, in order to make merging easier.

Note 3 Please submit this document in .doc format and NOT .pdf

Title: Comments on: MobileID Device BPR - 20080916

Date: October 28, 2008	Document: Approved Proposed Resolution of Comments
------------------------	--

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹ / # (e.g. FBI/1)	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition LEAVE THIS COLUMN BLANK
				that are not authorised to communicate with the central system ?		TBD
DHS/T SA114	10.3.9	Para 1 sentence 1 and last	ed	The term “user” may be incorrect here.	Change “user” To “operator” two instances	Accept Refer to DHS 3
DHS/T SA115		Para sentence	ed		Change “ “ To “ “	REJECT
DHS/T SA116		Para sentence	ed		Change “ “ To “ “	REJECT
ITAL/ 11	11		te	It is probably worth adding a Paragraph about the TETRA (Airwave) and Tetrapol radio communication networks, which are typically used by many Police Forces in Europe and in the World, and that can guarantee a more reliable communication especially during a critical situation, when cellular networks can likely become unusable due to technical failures or network saturation.	Add paragraph about TETRA and Tetrapol.	Reject.
FBI-C 10	11.1	Pg. 36	ed	Figure 1 reference should be Figure 3.		Accept
Sagem/ 17	11.2	First paragraph, 3 rd sentence	Ed	Change ‘use of short-range’ to ‘use of wireless technologies such as’ to accommodate future modes and types of wireless technology (such as 802.16/Wimax)	‘Dependent on the region of deployment connectivity may make use of wireless technologies such as Bluetooth or Wi-fi connections, cellular data lines, or satellite communications.’	Accept
FBI-V	Page 38	11.9	ed	Header is in different font than all other headers		Accept

1 MB = Member Body or Organization (enter 2-4 letter abbreviation)

2 Type of comment: ge = minor general Ge = major general te =minor technical Te =major technical ed = minor editorial Ed = major editorial. (Take care of Word changing te to Te etc.

NOTE 1 Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory. If column 4 is ge, use ge in column two also (and leave column 3 blank) if it applies to the whole document.

NOTE 2 MBs should not change the width of columns, in order to make merging easier.

Note 3 Please submit this document in .doc format and NOT .pdf

Title: Comments on: MobileID Device BPR - 20080916

Date: October 28, 2008	Document: Approved Proposed Resolution of Comments
------------------------	--

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹ / # (e.g. FBI/1)	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition LEAVE THIS COLUMN BLANK
35						
DHS/T SA118	11.4	Para 1 sentence 3	ed	Usage of “mobile identification”	Change “ Mobile Identification “ To “ Mobile ID “	Accept
FBI-V 24	Page 39	12.3	ed	Spelling “typically”		Accept
FBI-V 25	Page 39	Table 9	ed	First row of table has “-+14” remove minus sign		Accept
FBI-V 26	Page 39	Table 9	ge	Should “a row for Rain” be added to this table?	Rain	Reject But: Change Procedure II to Procedure I on Rain row in table 10. Eliminate “Procedure I” in relative humidity row.
FBI-V 27	Page 40	12.4	ed	Table ref should be “10” not “1”		Accept
Sagem/ 18	13.0	Page 41,	ed	Remove excess period trailing the sentence “The XML Part 2 version of the standard has now been approved”.	Remove excess period.	Accept
Sagem/	13.0	Page 41,	ed	Replace “mayl” with “may”.	Replace “mayl” with “may”.	Accept

1 MB = Member Body or Organization (enter 2-4 letter abbreviation)

2 Type of comment: ge = minor general Ge = major general te =minor technical Te =major technical ed = minor editorial Ed = major editorial. (Take care of Word changing te to Te etc.

NOTE 1 Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory. If column 4 is ge, use ge in column two also (and leave column 3 blank) if it applies to the whole document.

NOTE 2 MBs should not change the width of columns, in order to make merging easier.

Note 3 Please submit this document in .doc format and NOT .pdf

Title: Comments on: MobileID Device BPR - 20080916

Date: October 28, 2008	Document: Approved Proposed Resolution of Comments
------------------------	--

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹ / # (e.g. FBI/1)	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition LEAVE THIS COLUMN BLANK
19		2 nd paragraph, 3 rd sentence				
FBI-V 28	Page 41		ed	Extra period at end of first full sentence at top of page		Accept
FBI-V 29	Page 41	Para 2	ed	3 rd sentence has a typo "may!"		Accept
Sagem/ 20	A.2.2	Last sentence	ed	Consistency in the use of 'Mobile ID' and 'Mobile-ID'	Change 'Mobile-ID' to 'Mobile ID'	Accept
NPIA/ 27	A.2.4	Audio generation and recording	te	Is this section really relevant to this document? What does it actually tell us? Does this meet US user authentication requirements? It would not be acceptable in the UK, where 2 factor is a minimum sec requirement but a biometric is not part of that two factor authentication.		Accept: Change title: A.2.2 Audio Generation and Recording To Audio Feedback & see strikeout in document.
Sagem/ 21	A.3.2		Te	Section A.3.2 needs to include a subsection on Fake Finger Detection.	Propose a "Fake Finger Detection" subsection in Section A.3.2	Reject

1 MB = Member Body or Organization (enter 2-4 letter abbreviation)

2 Type of comment: ge = minor general Ge = major general te = minor technical Te = major technical ed = minor editorial Ed = major editorial. (Take care of Word changing te to Te etc.)

NOTE 1 Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory. If column 4 is ge, use ge in column two also (and leave column 3 blank) if it applies to the whole document.

NOTE 2 MBs should not change the width of columns, in order to make merging easier.

Note 3 Please submit this document in .doc format and NOT .pdf

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹ / # (e.g. FBI/1)	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition LEAVE THIS COLUMN BLANK
					Suggested description: "Mobile devices with the capability to detect fake finger(s) during image acquisition are desirable for increased security and integrity of the device."	
FBI-C 12	A.3.2.1		ed	Finger guides may also assist with reducing sequence errors.		Accept Add benefit
DHS/T SA122	A.3.2.2	Para 1 sentence 1	ed	The term "user" may be incorrect here.	Change "user" To "operator"	Accept
Sagem/ 22	A.3.2.9	First paragraph	ed	Use of effect versus affect. The word 'affect' is more appropriate to use versus effect which signifies "to cause to come into being" [Merriam-Webster]	'Aside from the recommendations and requirements listed above for the fingerprint capture device, other factors that affect the performance ...'	Accept
DHS/T SA123	A.3.2.9	Para 1 list item 9	ed	The term "user" may be incorrect here.	Change "user" To "operator"	Accept Refer to DHS 3
DHS/T SA124	A.3.3.1	Para 1 sentence 1 and 2	ed	Usage of "mobile identification"	Change " Mobile Identification " To " Mobile ID "	Accept
DHS/T SA125	A.3.3.3	Para 1 sentence 1	ed	Usage of "mobile identification"	Change " Mobile Identification "	Accept

1 MB = Member Body or Organization (enter 2-4 letter abbreviation)

2 Type of comment: ge = minor general Ge = major general te = minor technical Te = major technical ed = minor editorial Ed = major editorial. (Take care of Word changing te to Te etc.)

NOTE 1 Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory. If column 4 is ge, use ge in column two also (and leave column 3 blank) if it applies to the whole document.

NOTE 2 MBs should not change the width of columns, in order to make merging easier.

Note 3 Please submit this document in .doc format and NOT .pdf

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹ / # (e.g. FBI/1)	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition LEAVE THIS COLUMN BLANK
					To " Mobile ID "	
NPIA/ 28	A.3.4.3	Illumination	te	Considering the detail provided for face illumination, it is suprising that this section makes no reference to the fact the iris uses near IR illumination.	Include note that Iris cameras typically require IR illumination	Reject Referred to Iris group.
NPIA/ 29	A.3.4.4	Mechanical Alignments	ed	It took me a while to figure out what this meant. Is it an accepted term? If not a short explanation would be useful.		Noted Delete paragraph
ITAL/ 12	A.4.5		te	Other documents, in addition to the passport, can contain a Machine Readable Zone. It would be better to refer to a generic "MRZ reader", able to read an ICAO compliant MRZ in all the three different documents defined in ISO/IEC 7810:2003 (ID1, ID2 and ID3).	Rename the Paragraph "MRZ Reader". Change the paragraph content with the following: "An MRZ reader, if present in a Mobile ID device, should be able to read an ICAO compliant Machine Readable Zone, in the three different document formats (ID1, ID2 and ID3) defined in ISO/IEC 7810:2003. An OCR software should be integrated in the device, able to analyze the MRZ image and return its content in terms of ASCII characters.	Accept. But, Change Demographic Data to Textual Data in A.4 Title.
DHS/T SA126	A.5.2	Para 1 sentence 1	ed	The term "user" may be incorrect here.	Change "user" To "operator"	Accept Refer to DHS 3
Sagem/ 23	A.5.2.1 – A.5.25		ed	Consistency in font for outline titles.	Change to Arial versus Times Roman.	Accept
FBI-V 36	Page 47	A.5.2.1	ed	"life" should be capitalized in header		Accept

1 MB = Member Body or Organization (enter 2-4 letter abbreviation)

2 Type of comment: ge = minor general Ge = major general te =minor technical Te =major technical ed = minor editorial Ed = major editorial. (Take care of Word changing te to Te etc.

NOTE 1 Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory. If column 4 is ge, use ge in column two also (and leave column 3 blank) if it applies to the whole document.

NOTE 2 MBs should not change the width of columns, in order to make merging easier.

Note 3 Please submit this document in .doc format and NOT .pdf

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹ / # (e.g. FBI/1)	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition LEAVE THIS COLUMN BLANK
DHS/T SA127	A.5.2.3	Para 1 sentence 2	ed	Usage of “mobile identification”	Change “ Mobile Identification “ To “ Mobile ID “	Accept
NPIA/ 30	Annex B	Acquisition Considerations	ed	Much of this is covered elsewhere in the doc. Overall it is not clear what the purpose of this section is	Consider what this section is meant to add to the document.	Reject. Keep it in., and Change Acquisitions in the the title to “system Planning”
FBI-V 30	B Page 49	Para 3	ed	Sentence does not make sense		Accept. & corrected. Change to “accessing a resident database.
DHS/T SA128	B	Para 4	ed	The term “user” may be incorrect here.	Change “user” To “subject ”	Accept Refer to DHS 3
DHS/T SA129	B	Para 5	ed	The term “user” may be incomplete here.	Change “users” To “Users and operators ”	Accept Refer to DHS 3
FBI-C 13	Annex B	Responses	ed	Business practices should dictate officers should follow standard operating procedures.		Noted. Diane will reword and send to make generic.
FBI-C	Annex B	Legal	Ed	Editorial Comments such as “As the device can easily be abused and deemed a violation of	Users should develop and follow Appropriate	Noted. Diane will reword and send to make

1 MB = Member Body or Organization (enter 2-4 letter abbreviation)

2 Type of comment: ge = minor general Ge = major general te =minor technical Te =major technical ed = minor editorial Ed = major editorial. (Take care of Word changing te to Te etc.

NOTE 1 Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory. If column 4 is ge, use ge in column two also (and leave column 3 blank) if it applies to the whole document.

NOTE 2 MBs should not change the width of columns, in order to make merging easier.

Note 3 Please submit this document in .doc format and NOT .pdf

Title: Comments on: MobileID Device BPR - 20080916

Date: October 28, 2008	Document: Approved Proposed Resolution of Comments
------------------------	--

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹ / # (e.g. FBI/1)	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition LEAVE THIS COLUMN BLANK
14				privacy,” should be removed.	Use Policy.	generic.
FBI-V 31	Page 50		ed	First two references say “Facialm” should be “Facial”		Accept
FBI-V 32	Page 50		ed	Fourth reference has “20005” should be “2005”		Accept
DHS/T SA131	References	EFTS and EBTS	ed	The S stands for SPECIFICATION, not Standard	Change “ Standard “ To “ Specification “ 2-instances	Accept
DHS/T SA132	References	385	ed	This standard is not in the Registry, and is not referenced in this text	Delete this reference	Accept
DHS/T SA133	References to 378 and 381		ed	Form of the references to 378 and 381 are not consistent with the Registry. As listed in the Registry: 9. INCITS 378 INCITS 378:2004 - American National Standard for Information Technology — Finger Minutiae Format for Data Interchange http://webstore.ansi.org/ 10. INCITS 381 INCITS 381:2004 - American National Standard for Information Technology — Finger Image-Based Data Interchange Format. http://webstore.ansi.org/	Change references to: INCITS 378:2004 - American National Standard for Information Technology — Finger Minutiae Format for Data Interchange INCITS 381:2004 - American National Standard for Information Technology — Finger Image-Based Data Interchange Format	Accept
FBI-C 15	References	Pg. 50	ed	There are numerous documents and standards referenced within the document that are not included in the reference section.	All documents and standards referenced should be included in the References Section.	Accept. Diane Casteel will contribute
DHS/T SA134	Glossary	NIST	edhmmmmmm	Change “Institute for Standards” To “Institute of Standards ”	Accept.

1 MB = Member Body or Organization (enter 2-4 letter abbreviation)

2 Type of comment: ge = minor general Ge = major general te =minor technical Te =major technical ed = minor editorial Ed = major editorial. (Take care of Word changing te to Te etc.)

NOTE 1 Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory. If column 4 is ge, use ge in column two also (and leave column 3 blank) if it applies to the whole document.

NOTE 2 MBs should not change the width of columns, in order to make merging easier.

Note 3 Please submit this document in .doc format and NOT .pdf

Title: Comments on: MobileID Device BPR - 20080916

Date: October 28, 2008	Document: Approved Proposed Resolution of Comments
-------------------------------	---

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB¹/ # (e.g. FBI/1)	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition LEAVE THIS COLUMN BLANK
NPIA/31	Glossary		ed	Add XML		Accept

See following page for tables associated with comment DHS/TSA 73

1 **MB** = Member Body or Organization (enter 2-4 letter abbreviation)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = minor general **Ge** = major general **te** = minor technical **Te** = major technical **ed** = minor editorial **Ed** = major editorial. (Take care of Word changing **te** to **Te** etc.)

NOTE 1 Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory. If column 4 is **ge**, use **ge** in column two also (and leave column 3 blank) if it applies to the whole document.

NOTE 2 MBs should not change the width of columns, in order to make merging easier.

Note 3 **Please submit this document in .doc format and NOT .pdf**

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹ / # (e.g. FBI/1)	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition LEAVE THIS COLUMN BLANK

	SEVERE		MODERATE		MILD	
	SAP	#FINGERS	SAP	#FINGERS	SAP	#FINGERS
ENROLLMENT	45+	10	40+	6+	30+	4+
IDENTIFICATION	45+	4+	30+	4+	20+	2+
VERIFICATION	20+	2+	20+	2+	10+	1+
					5+	2+

	SEVERE	MODERATE	MILD
ENROLLMENT	In field enrollment into databases with applications where there is a high risk of loss of life or assets. Some situations may require multi-modal biometric enrollment. Enrollment should achieve an equivalent level of quality as if conducted in a controlled environment using non-mobile devices. Enrolling all fingers provides additional search capability.	Mobile booking: Field cite and release when the violation is not high enough to ensure incarceration until arraignment without bail.	The intention is for verification later (e-citations) is anticipated or an enrollment is sufficient for a normal tenprint to hit against on a many to one search.
IDENTIFICATION	One to many search against a database to identify a subject where there is a high risk of loss of life or assets. Some situations may require multi-modal biometric verification.	In field Mobile Identification of a subject with questionable or no identification.	Rapid identification in custody prior to formal booking. (Typically done at the jail intake.)
VERIFICATION	1:1 match against a credential or database to verify identity where there is a high risk of loss of life or assets. Some situations may require multi-modal biometric verification.	Personal Identity Verification (PIV) Release from custody.	Court Appearance/Parole/Workhouse, Personal Identity Verification (PIV).

1 MB = Member Body or Organization (enter 2-4 letter abbreviation)

2 Type of comment: ge = minor general Ge = major general te = minor technical Te = major technical ed = minor editorial Ed = major editorial. (Take care of Word changing te to Te etc.)

NOTE 1 Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory. If column 4 is ge, use ge in column two also (and leave column 3 blank) if it applies to the whole document.

NOTE 2 MBs should not change the width of columns, in order to make merging easier.

Note 3 Please submit this document in .doc format and NOT .pdf