Abstract: This contribution asks many questions and suggests modifications to the transport protocol (MIH_NET_SAP) and the acknowledgement state machine of clause 8.2 draft D5 April 2007.
IEEE 802.21 presentation release statements

This document has been prepared to assist the IEEE 802.21 Working Group. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.

The contributor grants a free, irrevocable license to the IEEE to incorporate material contained in this contribution, and any modifications thereof, in the creation of an IEEE Standards publication; to copyright in the IEEE’s name any IEEE Standards publication even though it may include portions of this contribution; and at the IEEE’s sole discretion to permit others to reproduce in whole or in part the resulting IEEE Standards publication. The contributor also acknowledges and accepts that this contribution may be made public by IEEE 802.21.

Subjects for discussion

• The MIH_NET_SAP as currently defined in D5 April 2007
  • Needs work
    • What is its function?
    • How is MIH_TP_Data.response to be implemented?
• Contains ambiguities
  • What is the meaning of Reliable Delivery Flag?
• Duplicates functionality
  • Is it repeating the reliable transport function?
  • Is it repeating the acknowledgement function defined in clause 8.2?

• MIH Protocol acknowledgement operation and state machines
Needs Work

• What is the MIH_NET_SAP’s function?
  • Is it to provide a generic service access point (SAP) for the transmission of MIH messages?
  • Is it hiding the actual method of transport from the MIH?
    • If so, then why
      – Reason for Transport Type (L2 or L3)?
      – Reliable Delivery Flag
        » Option of the transport type selected?
      – Transport Destination and Source Addresses
        » Dependent on Transport Type chosen

• How is MIH_TP_Data.response to be implemented?
  • Conclusion:
    • Delete all references to MIH-TP-Data.response primitive
Contains ambiguities

- What is the meaning of Reliable Delivery Flag?
  - Does it indicate that the MIH is requesting a reliable transport?
  - Does it indicate that the MIH is requesting a feature in the transport type chosen?
- Is the reliable delivery Flag
  - Used in combination with the MIH protocol acknowledgement operation?
  - Mutually exclusive to the MIH protocol acknowledgement operation?
  - Associated with the setting of the Ack Req / Ack Rsp of the MIH protocol acknowledgement operation?
Duplicates functionality

- Is it repeating the reliable transport function?
- Is it repeating the acknowledgement function defined in clause 8.2?
MIH command request & response (1of4)

State machine
MIH request
Source Node
INIT

SENDING

Version 1
Ack Req 1
Ack Rsp 0
SID 3
Opcode 1
AID 9
TransactionID X
S_MIHF SA
D_MIHF DA
See D5 -8.6.3.17

MIH_TP_Data.request
Transport Type 1
SA SA
DA DA
Reliable Delivery Flag T
MIH Protocol PDU

MIH_TP_Data.confirm
Transport Type 1
SA SA
DA DA
Status 0

State machine
MIH request
Destination Node
INIT

RECEIVED

Version 1
Ack Req 1
Ack Rsp 0
SID 3
Opcode 1
AID 9
TransactionID X
S_MIHF SA
D_MIHF DA
See D5 -8.6.3.17

MIH_TP_Data.indication
Transport Type 1
SA SA
DA DA
Reliable Delivery Flag T
MIH Protocol PDU

MIH_TP_Data.response
Transport Type 1
SA SA
DA DA
Status 0

MIH_MN_HO_Complete Request
AID 9, Not 23

MIH_MN_HO_Complete Request
AID 9, Not 23
MIH command request & response (3 of 4)

State machine
MIH request
Source Node

SENT

Version 1
Ack Req 1
Ack Rsp 0
SID 3
Opcode 2
AID 9
TransactionID X
S_MIHF SA
D_MIHF DA
See D5 - 8.6.3.18

MIH_MN_HO_Complete Response
AID 9, Not 23

MIH_TP_Data.indication
Transport Type 1
SA SA
DA DA
Reliable Delivery Flag T
MIH Protocol PDU

MIH_TP_Data.request
Transport Type 1
SA SA
DA DA
Reliable Delivery Flag T
MIH Protocol PDU

MIH_TP_Data.indication
Transport Type 1
SA SA
DA DA
Reliable Delivery Flag T
MIH Protocol PDU

MIH_TP_Data.response
Transport Type 1
SA SA
DA DA
Status 0

MIH_TP_Data.confirm
Transport Type 1
SA SA
DA DA
Status 0

State machine
MIH request
Destination Node

RECEIVED

Version 1
Ack Req 1
Ack Rsp 0
SID 3
Opcode 2
AID 9
TransactionID X
S_MIHF SA
D_MIHF DA
See D5 - 8.6.3.18

MIH_MN_HO_Complete Response
AID 9, Not 23

SENT

continue - P1a1

MIH_MN_HO_Complete Response
AID 9, Not 23

21-07-0182-01-0000
MIH protocol acknowledgement operation

- There are four state machines defined
  - Two for the source node and two for the destination node.
  - Two for the request and response service and two for the indication only service.

- Figure 24 State machine for MIH request source node
  - Missing transitions

- Figure 25 State machine for MIH request destination node
  - Missing transitions
  - Consistency with text

- Figure 26 State machine for MIH indication source node
  - Missing transitions

- Figure 27 State machine for MIH indication destination node
  - Missing transition
What happens when maximum retransmission attempts occur?

What happens if RSP is not received?

1) Should add (Start Transaction Timer) to all transitions out of INIT
2) Should add (Start Retransmission Timer) to transition from INIT to SENDING and to the loopback transition in SENDING
3) Should add to all states, except INIT, that do not have it, a transition for the expiry of Transaction timer.
What happens when maximum retransmission attempts occur?

1. Should add (Start Transaction Timer) to transition out of INIT
2. Should add (Start Retransmission Timer) to transition from RECEIVED to RESPONDING and to the feedback transition in RESPONDING
3. Should add to all states, except INIT, that do not currently have it, a transition for the expiry of Transaction timer

Received REQ / Send ACK if ACK-Req set and RSP not available
Otherwise no action

RSP available with ACK-Req set / Send RSP

Received ACK or Transaction TimeOut / Reset

Send RSP

Send RSP

Send RSP

Send RSP

Send RSP

Send RSP
Consistency (Figure 25 and 8.2.2.2.2)

- The third paragraph states, “If the MIH Request message has the ACK-Req bit set and the response is immediately available, the request destination node transits to RESPONDING state via RECEIVED state by sending the MIH Response message with ACK-Rsp bit set.”

- There are two transitions out of RECEIVED and both are for sending the RSP
  - If the RSP has the ACK-Req set, it goes to RESPONDING
  - If the RSP does not have the ACK-Req set, it goes to COMPLETED

- Text and figure do not agree. The choice of transition out of RECEIVED is not dependant upon the ACK-Req in the received REQ, but rather the choice of the ACK-Req bit in the RSP to be sent.

- Conclusion: The word "either" and "or COMPLETED" is added to the draft text to agree with the transitions shown in the figure.
  - If the MIH Request message has the ACK-Req bit set and the response is immediately available, the request destination node transits to "either“ RESPONDING "or COMPLETED" state via RECEIVED state by sending the MIH Response message with ACK-Rsp bit set.
What happens when maximum retransmission attempts occur?

1) Should add (Start Transaction Timer) to transition out of INIT to SENT
2) Should add (Start Retransmission Timer) to transition from INIT to RESPONDING and to the loopback transition in RESPONDING.
1) Should add (Start Transaction Timer) to transition out of INIT to RECEIVED
Conclusions

• There are many issues that need answers before either the transport protocol or the MIH protocol acknowledgement state machines can be finalized and made to operate properly.

• Agreed answers to posed questions could help to guide corrections, modifications, and new text for next version of the draft.

• Conclusion (transport protocol):
  • Delete all references to MIH-TP-Data.response primitive

• Conclusion (MIH protocol acknowledgement):
  • the word "either" and "or COMPLETED" is added to draft text to agree with transitions shown in the figure.
    • If the MIH Request message has the ACK-Req bit set and the response is immediately available, the request destination node transits to "either“ RESPONDING "or COMPLETED" state via RECEIVED state by sending the MIH Response message with ACK-Rsp bit set.