Accuracy in quantitative phase analysis of complex mineral assemblages: A decade of Reynolds Cup round robins

Mark D Raven and Peter G Self 24 April 2013







Outline

- The Reynolds Cup
- Sample Compositions
- Analytical techniques
- Quantitative analysis methods
- Summary
- Conclusions





The Reynolds Cup

- Biennial competition named after Bob Reynolds
- Established in 2000 by The Clay Minerals Society and sponsored by ChevronTexaco and the USGS
- Utilizes three sample mixtures of pure mineral phases that represent realistic sedimentary and weathered rock compositions
- Open to anyone interested in quantitative mineralogy using any available technique
- Commences early in the even numbered years
- Deadline approximately 1 month before the annual meeting of the CMS





The Reynolds Cup (cont)

Entrants are judged on sample biases

$$TotalBias = \sum abs (W_{actual} - W_{submitted})$$

- Top three with the lowest total bias are awarded with plaques and the winner receives the perpetual Reynolds Cup trophy
- Winner is invited to prepare samples for the next contest





Sample compositions

- Mudstone
- Sandstone
- Siltstone
- Calcareous mudstone
- Saline sedimentary rock
- Sediment from an evaporate environment
- Sample representing a hydrothermal alteration environment
- Soil formed on a parent material rich in ferromagnesian minerals and amorphous soil minerals
- Petroleum shale
- Nickel laterite
- Bauxite





Minerals used – non clays

- Quartz (18)
- K-feldspar (13)
- Plagioclase (14)
- Calcite (12)
- Dolomite (10)
- Magnesite (4)
- Aragonite (3)
- Huntite (1)
- Halite (6)
- Pyrite (7)
- Siderite (8)
- Barite (5)

- Gypsum (2)
- Anhydrite (2)
- Alunite (1)
- Hematite (6)
- Goethite (5)
- Magnetite (4)
- Anatase (9)
- Rutile (3)
- Ilmenite (3)
- Gibbsite (3)
- Bohmite (1)
- Fluorite (2)

- Apatite (1)
- Tourmaline (2)
- Zircon (2)
- Spinel (1)
- Opal-CT (1)
- Amphibole (3)
- Zeolite (1)
- Epidote (1)
- Birnessite (1)
- Arcanite (1)
- Amorphous (6)



Minerals used – clays

- 2:1 Dioctahedral Clays (18)
 - Smectite (montmorillonite, nontronite)
 - Mixed layered (illite-smectite, glauconite-smectite)
 - Mica/Illite (muscovite 2M₁, illite 1M_d, 1M)
- 2:1 Trioctahedral Clays (6)
 - Smectite (saponite)
 - Vermiculite
 - Mixed layered (corrensite)
 - Mica (biotite)

- Kaolin (15)
 - Kaolinite (well and poorly ordered)
 - Halloysite
 - Dickite
- Chlorite (11 clinochlore, ripidolite)
- Serpentine (2 lizardite)
- Talc (3)
- Sepiolite (1)
- Palygorskite (1)



Sample preparation

- Purification
 - Hand picking
 - Sieving
 - Magnetic separation
 - Chemical treatments
 - Size fractionation (<2μm, <0.5μm,<0.2μm)
 - Synthesis
- Preparation
 - Grinding
 - Sieving (200-400µm)
 - Check for purity (XRD)
- Equilibrate

- Weighing
- Mixing
 - Ball mill
 - End over end shaking
- Homogeneity checks
 - XRD
 - XRF
- Splitting
 - Random sampling
 - Rotary splitter
- Packaging and postage



Homogeneity check RC6-2 - XRD

RC6-2 Micronized





Homogeneity check RC6-2 - XRF

		2A	2B	2C	2D	2E	mean	stdev	CoV	max	min
SiO2	(%)	43.81	44.16	43.72	44.10	43.97	43.95	0.19	0.004	44.16	43.72
TiO ₂	(%)	0.34	0.34	0.33	0.34	0.34	0.34	0.00	0.007	0.34	0.33
Al ₂ O ₃	(%)	8.68	8.67	8.64	8.64	8.63	8.65	0.02	0.002	8.68	8.63
Fe ₂ O ₃	(%)	26.48	26.19	26.53	26.42	26.43	26.41	0.13	0.005	26.53	26.19
MnO	(%)	0.06	0.06	0.06	0.06	0.06	0.06	0.00	0.006	0.06	0.06
MgO	(%)	10.92	10.91	10.86	10.81	10.83	10.87	0.05	0.004	10.92	10.81
CaO	(%)	0.46	0.46	0.45	0.46	0.46	0.46	0.00	0.005	0.46	0.45
Na ₂ O	(%)	0.69	0.70	0.70	0.70	0.70	0.70	0.00	0.006	0.70	0.69
K₂O	(%)	1.55	1.58	1.56	1.59	1.57	1.57	0.01	0.009	1.59	1.55
P ₂ O ₅	(%)	0.04	0.04	0.04	0.04	0.04	0.04	0.00	0.012	0.04	0.04
SO3	(%)	0.01	0.01	0.01	0.01	0.01	0.01	0.00	0.077	0.01	0.01
Cl	(%)	0.01	0.01	0.01	0.01	0.01	0.01	0.00	0.073	0.01	0.01
Sum	(%)	93.05	93.13	92.92	93.18	93.04	93.06	0.10	0.001	93.18	92.92



Round robin statistics (2002-2012)

Year	Participants	Results Returned	Percentage Returned	Number of Mineral Phases
2002	40	15	37.5	36
2004	60	34	56.7	34
2006	64	37	57.8	42
2008	53	42	79.2	35
2010	76	63	82.9	42
2012	74	62	83.8	40
Total (mean)	367 (61.2)	253 (42.3)	(68.9)	229 (38.1)



Reynolds Cup Winners (2002-2012)

• 2002

- 1. Reinhard Kleeberg (Germany)
- 2. Reiner Dohrmann (Germany)
- 3. Dennis Eberl (USA) Steve Hillier (Scotland)
- 2004
 - **1.** Oladipo Omotoso (Canada)
 - 2. Douglas McCarty (USA)
 - 3. Steve Hillier (Scotland) Michael Plötze (Switzerland)
- 2006
 - **1.** Douglas McCarty (USA)
 - 2. Steve Hillier (Scotland)
 - 3. Reinhard Kleeberg (Germany)

• 2008

- **1.** Steve Hillier (Scotland)
- 2. Oladipo Omotoso (Canada) Reinhard Kleeberg and Kristian Ufer (Germany)
- Katja Emmerich & Annett Steudel (Germany) Steve Chipera (USA) Dennis Eberl & Alex Blum (USA) Mark Raven (Australia)
- 2010
 - 1. Mark Raven and Peter Self (Australia)
 - 2. Denny Eberl, Alex Blum, Mario Guzman, Marc Serravezza and Keith Morrison (USA)
 - 3. Reinhard Kleeberg and Kristian Ufer (Germany)
- 2012
 - 1. Michael Plötze (Switzerland)
 - 2. Steve Hillier (Scotland)
 - 3. Reinhard Kleeberg and Robert Möckel (Germany)



Participants of the 2012 Reynolds Cup

- 74 registrants
- 25 countries
 - Australia (4)
 - Belgium (1)
 - Canada (1)
 - China (1)
 - Colombia (2)
 - Denmark (1)
 - France (6)
 - Germany (11)
 - Greece (2)
 - Hungary (1)
 - India (1)
 - Italy (1)

- Kenya (1)
- Korea (1)
- Norway (1)
- Poland (2)
- Russia (6)
- Saudi Arabia (2)
- Slovakia (1)
- South Africa (1)
- Spain (2)
- Switzerland (1)
- Turkey (3)
- United Kingdom (6)
- United States of America (15)





Analytical techniques employed (2002-2012)

- Primary quantification technique
 - XRD (>97%)
 - IR, FT-IR, Raman spectroscopy, SEM/TEM, Mossbauer (<3%)
- Ancillary techniques
 - Chemical analysis (XRF, ICP, neutron activation)
 - FT-IR, VNIR reflectance
 - DTA-TGA-DSC
 - Electron microscopy (SEM/TEM-EDX)
 - Wet chemistry
 - CEC
 - Carbonate analysis
 - Surface area
 - Optical microscopy, petrography
 - Mossbauer
 - Ion chromatography



XRD techniques (2002-2012)

- Bulk pressed powders
- Magnetic fraction
- Optical separation
- Grain size separation
 - Sieving
 - Dispersion and sedimentation
- Oriented samples
 - Cation saturations
 - Heating
 - Ethylene glycol/glycerol solvation





XRD quantification techniques (2002-2012)

- Single peak methods (21.0%)
 - Matrix flushing
 - NEWMOD
 - RIR ICDD-PDF
- Whole pattern techniques (19.5%)
 - Arquant
 - Fullpat
 - Hillier
 - Quanta
 - Rancourt and Dang
 - RockJock
 - X-LS Mineral

- Rietveld method (57.0%)
 - AutoQuan/BGMN
 - Fullprof
 - GSAS
 - HighScore Plus
 - Jade
 - Maud
 - Quanto
 - RIQAS
 - SIROQUANT
 - Topas
- Educated guess!



Results (2004)

	RC2-1(wt.%)			RC2-2(wt.%)			RC2-3(wt.%)		
Mineral	(wt.%)	Adj. (wt.%)	۵	(wt.%)	Adj. (wt.%)	۵	(wt.%)	Adj. (wt.%)	•
Quartz	24.8	25.1	0.3	45.7	47.0	1.3	14.7	14.8	0.1
K-Feldspar	8.5	8.3	0.2	9.2	9.5	0.3	2.1	2.9	0.8
Albite	6.5	8.3		4.0	11.7		0.0	3.7	
Oligoclase	0.0			6.7			2.9		
other plagioclase	0.0			0.0			0.0		
Plagioclase	6.5	8.3	1.8	10.7	11.7	1.0	2.9	3.7	0.8
Calcite	5.0	5.3	0.3	0.0		0.0	18.6	17.7	0.9
Dolomite	2.0			0.0			6.0		
Ankerite	0.0			0.0			0.0		
Dolomite	2.0	2.1	0.1	0.0	0.0	0.0	6.0	5.8	0.2
Magnesite	0.0		0.0	0.0		0.0	4.9	4.6	0.3
Halite	0.0		0.0	0.0		0.0	1.5	1.7	0.2
Anhydrite	0.0		0.0	0.0		0.0	14.6	14.6	0.0
Pyrite	2.5	2.4	0.1	0.0		0.0	0.0		0.0
Hematite	0.0		0.0	2.5	2.4	0.1	0.0		0.0
Anatase	0.1		0.1	1.5	1.4	0.1	0.0		0.0
Rutile	0.0		0.0	1.5	1.2	0.3	0.0		0.0
Total Non-clay	49.4	51.5	2.9	71.1	73.2	3.1	65.3	65.8	3.3
Kaolinite	16.0	15.2		9.9	14.4		0.0	0.1	
Dickite	0.0			5.5			0.0		
Kaolinite group	16.0	15.2	0.8	15.4	14.4	1.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
Illite 1Mt	10.5			5.5			0.0		
I/S mixed layer	10.1	25.0		0.0	10.2		0.0		
Montmorillonite	9.5	5.0		0.0			8.0	6.3	
Muscovite 2M1	0.0			5.0			17.1	18.4	
other dioct. 2:1 phase	0.0			0.0			0.0		
Total dioct 2:1 clay and									
mica	30.1	30.0	0.1	10.5	10.2	0.3	25.1	24.7	0.4
Chlorite	4.5	3.3	1.2	3.0	2.3	0.7	9.6	9.4	0.2
Total clay	50.6	48.5	2.1	28.9	26.9	2.0	34.7	34.1	0.6
Total identified	100.0	100.0	5.0	100.0	100.1	5.1	100.0	99.9	3.9
Bias non-clay		2.9			3.1			3.3	
Bias clay		2.1			2.0			0.6	
Total bias		5.0			5.1			3.9	
Sum + Misidentified					14.0				

Nr	Participant	Total bias RC2/1	Total bias RC2/2	Total bias RC2/3	Sum bias
1	19	5.00	5.10	3.90	14.00
2	13	7.20	4.80	8.60	20.60
3	1	13.60	8.20	4.50	26.30
4	15	3.60	12.20	12.90	28.70
5	3	15.00	6.30	19.00	40.30
6	17	13.70	15.00	17.70	46.40
7	57	17.00	16.60	13.40	47.00
8	47	15.00	15.00	17.10	47.10
9	42	15.80	10.80	20.80	47.40
10	29	22.20	16.00	13.80	52.00





Total biases for all contests (2002-2012)





Misidentified phases

Ilmenite

Iron Silicor

Jarosite

KAISiO4

Kaolinite

K-feldspar

Kieserite

Laueite

Leucite

Lithosite

Lizardite

Magnesite

Magnetite

Malachite

Manganite

Mg7Zn3

MgSO4

Mica

Mg-calcite

Microcline

Missing

Monazite

Mullite

Nacrite

Na-Feldspar

Natrolite

Nepheline

Norrishite

Oligoclase

Olivine

Opal CT

Orthoclase

Osumilite

oxide 1

oxide 2

Periclase

Perovskite

Phillipsite

Palygorskite

OrthoPyroxene

Opal

Nitride Silicon

Nordstrandite

Mica Trioctahedral

Monohydrocalcite

Montmorillonite (Tri

Moschellandsbergite

Melantenite

Magnesioferrite

Lime

K-rich Chlorite

Kutnohorite

Laumonite

Lepidocrocite

Iron

ilterstratified (tri

kaolinite/smectite

Kaolinite-Chlorite

Actinolite Aegerine Aerinite Akaganeite Albite/anorthite Allophane Alluaudite Almandine Al-Mg AIO Alumina gamma Aluminite Alunite Alunogen Amorphous Amorphous (Allophane) Amorphous KAISi3O8 Amorphous Si Amorphous SiO2 Amorphous Volcanic Glass Amphibole Analcime Anatase Andesine Anhydrite Ankerite Anorthite Antigorite Antlerite Apatite Aragonite Arcanite Arsenolite As2O3 Augite Barite Bazalt Berthierine Biotite Birnessite Bromcarnallite Brookite Brucite Brushite Bytownite C6H5O3PZn Calcite CaMg2Al16O27 Carbonate-fluorapatite Carnallite CaSiO3 Celestine Chabazite Chalcosite Chlorargyrite Chlorite Dioctahedral Chlorite Trioctahedral Chlorite-Montmorillonite(Tri) Chlorite-Smectite Trioctahedral Chlorite-vermiculite Chromite

Chrysotile Clinochlore Clinoenstate Clinoptilolite ClinoPyroxene Clinozoisite Cordierite Corrensite Corundum Cotunnite Cristobalite Cryptohalite Crysotile Diaspore Dickite Dickite/Nacrite Diopside Dolomite Dolomite/Ankerite Elpidite Enstatite Epidote Euclase Faujasite Fe oxide Fedorite Feldspar (Kspar Ferrihydrite Ferrite magnesian Fluorapatite Forsterite Galeite Garnet Gehlenite Gibbsite Gismondine Glass/Obsidian Glauberite Glauconite Goethite Gypsum Halite Halite potassiar Halloysite Hectonite Hedenbergite Hematite Hercynite Heulandite Hexahydrite Hornblende Hotsonite Hyalophane hydrated Ca-Mg carbonate Hydrocalumite Hydrotalcite Hydroxyapophyllite Hydroxylapatite Hypersthene Illite Tri

Phlogopite (2M1) Potarite Prehnite Pvrite Pyrolusite Pyroxene Pyrrhotite Rectorite Reverite Rhodonite Rutile Sanidine Saponite Sauconite Schorl Sepiolite Siderite Mica-Vermiculite Trioctahedral Silicon Sillimanite Sodalite Spencerite Spinel Staurolite Sylvite Syngenite Talc Thenardite Titanite Others not precisely identified Trimerite Trydymite Tungstite Vaterite

Phlogopite (mica-trioctahedral) phosphate hydrate Plagioclase Portlandite Pseudobrookite Pumpellyite pyrophyllite 1T pyrophyllite 2M Pyroxene (Augite) Pyroxene (Ferroan Diopside) Rhodochrosite Rodolicoite Serpentine Siderite (Mn-rich) Siderite(not Mg) Silicon dioxide Smectite trioctahedral Smithsonite Sphalerite iron Strontianite Szomolnokite Thermonatrite Titanomagnetite Tobermorite Tourmaline Unidentified Unnamed hydrate Vauxite

Vermiculite Vermiculite Trioctahedral Vermiculite/illite Vermiculite-Smectite Trioctahedral Vesuvianite Wagnerite Wavellite Whitlockite Whitmoreite Wollastonite Wroewolfeite Wuestite Zeolite Zeophyllite Zinnwaldite Zircon Zirconium sulphate hydroxide hydrate Zoisite

Misidentified phases

Ilmenite

Iron Silicor

Jarosite

KAISiO4

Kaolinite

K-feldspar

Kieserite

Laueite

Leucite

Lithosite

Lizardite

Magnesite

Magnetite

Manganite

Melantenite

Malachite

Mg7Zn3

MgSO4

Mica

Mg-calcite

Microcline

Missing

Monazite

Mullite

Nacrite

Na-Feldspar

Natrolite

Nepheline

Norrishite

Oligoclase

Olivine

Opal CT

Orthoclase

Osumilite

oxide 1

oxide 2

Periclase

Perovskite

Phillipsite

Palygorskite

OrthoPyroxene

Opal

Nitride Silicon

Nordstrandite

Mica Trioctahedral

Monohydrocalcite

Montmorillonite (Tri

Moschellandsbergite

Magnesioferrite

Lime

Laumonite

Lepidocrocite

K-rich Chlorite

Kutnohorite

Iron

ilterstratified (tri

kaolinite/smectite

Kaolinite-Chlorite

Actinolite Aegerine Aerinite Akaganeite Albite/anorthite Allophane Alluaudite Almandine Al-Mg AIO Alumina gamma Aluminite Alunite Alunogen Amorphous Amorphous (Allophane) Amorphous KAISi3O8 Amorphous Si Amorphous SiO2 Amorphous Volcanic Glass Amphibole Analcime Anatase Andesine Anhydrite Ankerite Anorthite Antigorite Antlerite Apatite Aragonite Arcanite Arsenolite As203 Augite Barite Bazalt Berthierine Biotite Birnessite Bromcarnallite Brookite Brucite Brushite Bytownite C6H5O3PZn Calcite CaMg2Al16O27 Carbonate-fluorapatite Carnallite CaSiO3 Celestine Chabazite Chalcosite Chlorargyrite Chlorite Dioctahedral Chlorite Trioctahedral Chlorite-Montmorillonite(Tri) Chlorite-Smectite Trioctahedral Chlorite-vermiculite Chromite

Chrysotile Clinochlore Clinoenstate Clinoptilolite ClinoPyroxene Clinozoisite Cordierite Corrensite Corundum Cotunnite Cristobalite Cryptohalite Crysotile Diaspore Dickite Dickite/Nacrite Diopside Dolomite Dolomite/Ankerite Elpidite Enstatite Epidote Euclase Faujasite Fe oxide Fedorite Feldspar (Kspar Ferrihydrite Ferrite magnesian Fluorapatite Forsterite Galeite Garnet Gehlenite Gibbsite Gismondine Glass/Obsidian Glauberite Glauconite Goethite Gypsum Halite Halite potassiar Halloysite Hectonite Hedenbergite Hematite Hercynite Heulandite Hexahydrite Hornblende Hotsonite Hyalophane hydrated Ca-Mg carbonate Hydrocalumite Hydrotalcite Hydroxyapophyllite Hydroxylapatite Hypersthene Illite Tri

Plagioclase Portlandite Potarite Prehnite Pumpellyite Pvrite Pyrolusite pyrophyllite 1T Pyroxene Pyrrhotite Rectorite Reverite Rhodochrosite Rhodonite Rodolicoite Rutile Sanidine Saponite Sauconite Schorl Sepiolite Serpentine Siderite Mica-Vermiculite Trioctahedral Silicon Silicon dioxide Sillimanite Smithsonite Sodalite Spencerite . Sphalerite iron Spinel Staurolite Strontianite Sylvite Syngenite Szomolnokite Talc Thenardit Thermonatrite Titanite Titanomagnetite Tobermorite Tourmaline Others not precisely identified Trimerite Trydymite Tungstite Unidentified Unnamed hydrate Vaterite Vauxite

Phlogopite (2M1) Phlogopite (mica-trioctahedral) phosphate hydrate Pseudobrookite pyrophyllite 2M Pyroxene (Augite) Pyroxene (Ferroan Diopside) Siderite (Mn-rich) Siderite(not Mg) Smectite trioctahedral

Vermiculite Vermiculite Trioctahedral Vermiculite/illite Vermiculite-Smectite Trioctahedral Vesuvianite Wagnerite Wavellite Whitlockite Whitmoreite Wollastonite Wroewolfeite Wuestite Zeolite Zeophyllite Zinnwaldite Zircon Zirconium sulphate hydroxide hydrate Zoisite

260.

Bias for all participants and all samples (2002-2012)





How is accuracy quantified?







Calvert et al 1989. Quantitative mineral analysis of clays. CMS Workshop Lectures Vol 1. 154-166.







Quartz – X^{-0.5}



S. Hillier 2003. Quantitative analysis of clay and other minerals in sandstones by XRPD. Int. Assoc. Sedimentol. Spec. Publ. 34, 213-251







Quartz – X^{-0.85}



S. Hillier 2003. Quantitative analysis of clay and other minerals in sandstones by XRPD. Int. Assoc. Sedimentol. Spec. Publ. 34, 213-251



Are we there yet? Quartz ■ ±3% ■ X^-0.5 ■ X^-0.85 Participants meeting criteria (%) Year



Kaolin clays – ±3%, X^{-0.5}, X^{-0.85}

Analyses that meet the criteria: 231 (37.8%), 262 (42.9%), 119 (19.5%) Absolute Bias (wt.%) **Relative Bias (%)** Measured Composition (wt.%) Relative Error (%) Actual Composition (wt.%) Actual composition (wt.%)







2:1 Dioctahedral clays – ±3%, X^{-0.5}, X^{-0.85}

Analyses that meet the criteria: 241 (32.4%), 300 (40.3%), 157 (21.1%)

Absolute Bias (wt.%)

Relative Bias (%)



Are we there yet?

2:1 Dioctahedral Clays

■ ±3% ■ X^-0.5 ■ X^-0.85







Summary

- 10 years of Reynolds Cup round robins
- 6 contests
- 18 sample mixtures
- 35 non-clays and 8 clay mineral groups
- 367 participants
- Almost 10,000 analyses
- 6 winners from 6 different countries





Conclusions

- Has accuracy improved?
 - As individuals
 - As a group
- Some participants consistently achieve excellent results
- Some participants have a long way to go
 - Sample preparation
 - Instrument settings
 - Inappropriate or incorrect use of Software



Reynolds Cup 2014

 Announcement of 7th round robin in late 2013 or early 2014 on the CMS web site, and various email lists (CMS, Rietveld, AIPEA, etc)

 Winners announced at the 2014 CMS annual meeting, 17-20th May 2014 at Texas A&M University, College Station, TX, USA.

• GOOD LUCK!

Thank you

Land and Water Mark D Raven

- t +61 8 8303 8497 e Mark.Raven@csiro.au
- w www.csiro.au/

Land and Water Peter G Self

- **t** +61 8 8273 8103
- e Peter.Self@csiro.au
- w www.csiro.au/

CSIRO LAND AND WATER / MINERALS DOWN UNDER FLAGSHIP www.csiro.au

