NIST PRIVACY WORKFORCE PUBLIC WORKING GROUP (PWWG)

Co-Chair: Dylan Gilbert, Privacy Policy Advisor, National Institute of Standards and Technology

MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday, May 11, 2022
1:00 P.M. EDT – 2:00 P.M. EDT

I.   INTRODUCTION

The 13th meeting of the National Institute of Standards and Technology (NIST) Privacy Workforce Public Working Group (PWWG) convened on Wednesday, April 13th, 2022 from 1:00 P.M. - 2:00 P.M. EDT virtually via Microsoft Teams.

Co-Chair, Dylan Gilbert, NIST Privacy Policy Advisor, welcomed the members and Project Teams Leads and thanked them for their participation. Dylan provided a brief overview of the meeting agenda which included: an update on the NIST Privacy Framework and PWWG Task, Knowledge, and Skill (TKS) Mapping documents; Project Team updates; and Resources discussion.

II.   PWWG UPDATES

Co-Chair: Dylan Gilbert provided a brief update of the general status of the PWWG Project Teams and activities.

A.   PRIVACY FRAMEWORK >< PWWG TKS MAPPING

Dylan encouraged working group members to view the mapping of completed TKS Statements to the Privacy Framework Core[1]. The read-only PDFs are accessible to PWWG members via the PWWG Reference Documents folder on the shared [PWWG Reference Documents Folder - Google Drive](#) and on the individual project team Google Drives. The mapping will be particularly helpful for Project Team members to get a sense of what to aim for in terms of level of granularity and the optimal number of statements. As each team completes its work this mapping document will continue to grow. Project Team 1 (Risk Assessment) is nearing completion and will be the next Category to be added to the mapping.

B.   CALL FOR PT5 LEADS!

The work of Project Team 1 (PT1) will be wrapping up in the next few weeks. The next team to be started up will be Project Team 5 (PT5). This new project team will focus on the Business Environment Category of the Identify Function of the Privacy Framework (ID.BE-P).

Function - Identify-P (ID-P): Develop the organizational understanding to manage privacy risk for individuals arising from data processing.
Category - Business Environment (ID.BE-P): The organization's mission, objectives, stakeholders, and activities are understood and prioritized; this information is used to inform privacy roles, responsibilities, and risk management decisions.
  Subcategories
  • **ID.BE-P1**: The organization's role(s) in the data processing ecosystem are identified and communicated.

---

[1] [NIST Privacy Framework Core](#)

- **ID.BE-P2**: Priorities for organizational mission, objectives, and activities are established and communicated.
- **ID.BE-P3**: Systems/products/services that support organizational priorities are identified and key requirements communicated.

The NIST PWWG team will send out a survey via the PWWG mailing list this week to solicit volunteers who are interested in being a Co-Lead on this new project team. The survey will remain open for one week. The PWWG Co-Chairs will select the new team Co-Chairs from those who express an interest. The selection process will be completed by May 26, 2022. The new team is expected to begin in June.

III.   PROJECT TEAM UPDATES

C.   PROJECT TEAM 1: RISK ASSESSMENT (ID.RA-P) ACTIVITIES

Category - Risk Assessment (ID.RA-P): *The organization understands the privacy risks to individuals and how such privacy risks may create follow-on impacts on organizational operations, including mission, functions, other risk management priorities (e.g., compliance, financial), reputation, workforce, and culture.*
Subcategories –
- **ID.RA-P1**: Contextual factors related to the systems/products/services and the data actions are identified (e.g., individuals' demographics and privacy interests or perceptions, data sensitivity and/or types, visibility of data processing to individuals and third parties).
- **ID.RA-P2**: Data analytic inputs and outputs are identified and evaluated for bias.
- **ID.RA-P3**: Potential problematic data actions and associated problems are identified.
- **ID.RA-P4**: Problematic data actions, likelihoods, and impacts are used to determine and prioritize risk.
- **ID.RA-P5**: Risk responses are identified, prioritized, and implemented.

Dylan gave an overview of the work of Project Team 1 (PT1). The team is currently working through the PWWG Co-Chair comments on the TKS Statements in ID.RA.P1 and ID.RA-P3 Subcategories. The Co-Chairs will complete Subcategories ID.RA-P4 and ID.RA-P5 this week. The final Subcategory, ID.RA-P2, concerns bias in AI systems. The PWWG team is coordinating with colleagues from the NIST AI team on next steps for TKS Statement development.

D.   PROJECT TEAM 3: POLICIES, PROCESSES, AND PROCEDURES (GV.PO-P, CT.PO-P, CM.PO-P) ACTIVITIES

Governance Policies, Processes, and Procedures (GV.PO-P): *The policies, processes, and procedures to manage and monitor the organization's regulatory, legal, risk, environmental, and operational requirements are understood and inform the management of privacy risk.*

Data Processing Policies, Processes, and Procedures (CT.PO-P): *Policies, processes, and procedures are maintained and used to manage data processing (e.g., purpose, scope, roles and responsibilities in the data processing ecosystem, and management commitment) consistent with the organization's risk strategy to protect individuals' privacy.*

Communication Policies, Processes, and Procedures (CM.PO-P): *Policies, processes, and procedures are maintained and used to increase transparency of the organization's data processing practices (e.g., purpose, scope, roles and responsibilities in the data processing ecosystem, and management commitment) and associated privacy risks.*

Project Team 3 (PT3) Co-Lead, Dan Lo Presto, Director, Privacy Compliance, University of Central Florida gave an update on the work of PT3. Fellow Co-Lead, Amin Ali recently chose to step down as team Co-Lead after taking on a new professional opportunity. Dan and fellow Co-Lead, Nandita Narla, Senior Privacy Program Manager, Door Dash would like a third person to serve with them as Co-Lead. If anyone is interested in this Co-Lead opportunity, they should email pwwg@nist.gov.

Dan noted that PT3 is currently developing draft TKS Statements for GV.PO-P3 (Roles and responsibilities for the workforce are established with respect to privacy.) Dan encouraged people to leave their proposed statements in the "INPUT" tab in the TKS Workbook between biweekly meetings. It is a joint effort to develop the TKS Statements and while there are differences of opinion and experience, everyone's input is appreciated and addressed.

The Project Team 3 Co-Leads continue to encourage the participation, expertise, and perspectives of the larger NIST PWWG Membership to assist in the development process of the PT3 TKS Statements. They welcome more members to join the team (see the Join Mailing List Section below).

E. **PROJECT TEAM 4: DATA PROCESSING ECOSYSTEM RISK MANAGEMENT (ID.DE-P) ACTIVITIES**

Data Processing Ecosystem Risk Management (ID.DE-P): *Data Processing Ecosystem Risk Management (ID.DE-P): The organization's priorities, constraints, risk tolerance, and assumptions are established and used to support risk decisions associated with managing privacy risk and third parties within the data processing ecosystem. The organization has established and implemented the processes to identify, assess, and manage privacy risks within the data processing ecosystem.*

Project Team 4 (PT4) Co-Lead, Tahir Latif, Head of Practice, Data Protection, Artificial Intelligence and Analytics (APAC & EMEA) Cognizant Worldwide provided an update on the work of Project Team 4 (PT4). There was a recent surge in new members joining PT4 and the membership now totals 105. PT4 is currently developing draft TKS Statements for Subcategory ID.DE-P2 (Data processing ecosystem parties (e.g., service providers, customers, partners, product manufacturers, application developers) are identified, prioritized, and assessed using a privacy risk assessment process).

Tahir noted that there was a learning curve for the team on how to structure the TKS Statements. He reminded the new members of the team to read the Authoring Guide and become familiar with the other reference documents found on the PT4 Google drive. Tahir encouraged members to use the time between meetings to enter proposed TKS Statements in the "INPUT" tab in the TKS Workbook on the Google drive. They are also invited to leave comments on TKS Statements that are under discussion in the TKS Workbook Subcategory tabs. Tahir expects that the team will have some draft TKS Statements ready for the Co-Chairs in the next few sessions.

Dylan reiterated the importance of team members making sure they are up to speed on the TKS Authoring Guide, and the other PWWG reference documents found on the team Google drives. That will allow the meeting time to be used for substance rather than focusing on the structure of the statements. It is also critical that team members use the time between meetings to add proposed TKS Statements for the team to discuss during the project team meetings.

IV.   RESOURCES DISCUSSION

Co-Chair, Dylan Gilbert led a discussion regarding the use of resources within the PWWG TKS Statements Mapping documents. Do we want resources to be included or not? An argument has been made that the TKS Statements need additional supplemental guidance to assist with implementation. Project Team 2 came up with some citations and explanatory notes for a few of their TKS Statements.

Do we want resources to be included or not? Some examples of resources include: citations to informative references (e.g. academic scholarship, reports); explanatory notes; links to related NIST publications (e.g., NISTIR, SP series).

Dylan noted that before going ahead with this, there are several important considerations:
- A methodology (principles and rules) for determining when to include a given resource would be required.
- A methodology (principles and rules) for determining which resource(s) to include would be required.
- Who is the intended audience(s)?
- How do we keep these resources up to date? Who will keep them up to date?
- Will these be community generated in the future? Community of interest dedicated to resources?

While offering these resources would be helpful, in reality, we would have to be very intentional about how to build out this additional work that goes beyond the intended scope of PWWG work.

Options:
1. Move forward with including resources and begin implementation process (i.e., who, what, when?)
2. Opt-out of including resources as part of core PWWG work
3. Save for a later stage in the PWWG process (i.e., after the first set of TKS Statements are published)
4. Finish the TKS Statements and then make this assessment.

Dylan invited comments from the attendees.

Discussion/Chat:
- Team 2 found that including the references was worthwhile. We felt that the ones we included were necessary.
- The original thrust for including them in PT2 was to give context. We thought those resources were for internal NIST purposes at first to help to explain why we came up with these TKS Statements.
- Chat: TKS Statements should have background references or accompanying resources. Am also for reassessment given completion of the TKS Statements.
- Chat: Explanatory guidance would be useful when the Task has multiple potential avenues of compliance, for example using TKS Statements for job role where there are multiple potential good fits for a field, giving that list of potentials. I wouldn't suggest references due to the points of maintenance and validation that would be required.
- Chat: This is a whole new sidecar project, count the cost. It may be a good trailing project post TKS.

- Chat: If we provide too much detail/explanation, are we in danger of reducing the flexibility a privacy team needs to create policy? We want to help, not manage?
- Chat: You could always start some type of requirements gathering exercise. Formalizing resources and references for TKS to follow additional control self-assessment.

V.   Q & A

- Question: Is there a framework for Privacy Engineering functions? Job families/job descriptions? What is the status of NIST CSF job families/job descriptions?
  - o   Dylan answered: Creating notional work roles using PWWG TKS Statements could be a great project for a "Phase 2." We could use the NICE work roles for reference.
  - o   Comment: We may be able to pull some things together for the digital privacy effort.
  - o   Dylan agreed that when the TKS set is complete it could be used for a work role, academic curriculum, competencies, among other things.

- Question: How many task forces will there be in total? We're starting up number 5, and then how many more opportunities are there to participate in another one?
  - o   Answer: It is unclear, we may combine some Categories but there will likely be at least 5 more Project Teams.

VI.   NEXT STEPS & UPCOMING MEETINGS

A.   NEXT STEPS

- Project Teams 3 and 4 will continue to draft, refine, and finalize TKS Statements and submit to the Co-Chairs for review and comment.
- Project Team 1 will continue to review the Co-Chair feedback as they work to finalize the ID.RA-P TKS Statements.
- NIST will send out survey asking for volunteers to Co-Lead Project Team 5
- Co-Chairs will continue to review TKS Statements and will provide feedback to the Project Teams to discuss and provide a consensus.
- New Business Open Discussion Topics Drop Box is available on the NIST Privacy Workforce Working Group webpage. If you are interested in presenting a business topic during a PWWG Monthly Meeting, please visit the webpage noted above.

B.   UPCOMING MEETINGS

The upcoming meetings of the NIST PWWG and its Project Teams are noted below. For further information, including updated meeting schedules, meeting minutes, agendas, and slide deck please visit the PWWG web page.

Project Team 1: Risk Assessment (ID.RA-P)

- Wednesday, May 18, 2022 | 5:00 p.m. - 6:00 p.m. EDT
- Thursday, May 25, 2022 | 5:00 p.m. - 6:00 p.m. EDT – Additional meeting
- Thursday, June 2, 2022 | 11:00 a.m. - 12:00 p.m. EDT

Project Team 3: Policies, Processes, And Procedures (GV.PO-P, CT.PO-P, CM.PO-P)

- Thursday, May 12, 2021 | 1:00 p.m. – 1:00 p.m. EDT

- Thursday, May 26, 2021 | 1:00 p.m. – 1:00 p.m. EDT

Project Team 4: Data Processing Ecosystem Risk Management (ID.DE-P)

- Thursday, May 19, 2022 | 2:00 p.m. - 12:00 p.m. EDT
- Thursday, June 2, 2022 | 2:00 p.m. - 12:00 p.m. EDT

NIST Privacy Workforce Public Working Group

- The NIST PWWG Monthly Meeting is the 2nd Wednesday of each month.
- Wednesday, June 13, 2022 |1:00 p.m. – 2:00 p.m. EDT

C.   NEW BUSINESS OPEN TOPICS

New Business Open Discussion Topics Drop Box is available on the NIST Privacy Workforce Working Group webpage. If you are interested in presenting a business topic during a PWWG Monthly Meeting, please visit the webpage noted above.

D.   JOIN MAILING LIST

In order to join one of the Project Teams you must subscribe to its associated mailing list. All mailing lists are moderated. Please be reminded to review adhere to the Mailing List Rules that can be found on the NIST Privacy Workforce Working Group website.

- Privacy Workforce Working Group (PWWG):
    PrivacyWorkforceWG+subscribe@list.nist.gov
- Project Team 1 (PT1): PrivacyWorkforcePT1+subscribe@list.nist.gov
- Project Team 3 (PT3)PrivacyWorkforcePT3+subscribe@list.nist.gov
- Project Team 4 (PT4)PrivacyWorkforcePT4+subscribe@list.nist.gov

If you have any technical issues with meeting invitations, mailing lists, and/or accessing the Google Drives, please email NIST PWWG Support at PWWG@nist.gov.